



PUBH 6564, SECTION [course section]

Private Purchasers of Health Care: Roles of Employers and Health Plans in the Care System
Fall/2018

COURSE & CONTACT INFORMATION

Credits: 2

Meeting Day(s): Mondays, September 10 – December 10, 2018

Meeting Time: 1:25 – 3:20 PM

Meeting Place: D199 Mayo

Instructor: Jon B. Christianson

Email: chris001@umn.edu

Office Phone: 612-625-3849 D199 Mayo

Fax: 612-624-2196

Office Hours: By Appointment

Office Location: 15-225 Phillips Wangensteen Building

COURSE DESCRIPTION

Add course description] Payments received from private insurance companies are critical to the financial survival of most health care providers. These funds come for the most part from employers that pay insurance companies to manage their employee health care expenses (considered to be part of employee compensation). The purpose of this course is to help future health care managers understand the goals of their best customers and how health plans and employers pursue these goals. The course examines the role of employers and health plans in the health care system and, specifically, how the payers of the bills for health care develop and implement strategies to achieve their organizational and health care system goals. Topics covered include measurement of provider performance, health benefit design, efforts to support consumers in their health care decisions (provision of information to inform choice of providers, choice of treatment options and providers, management of chronic illnesses, and engagement in health promotion activities), provider contracting and utilization management, and provider payment.

COURSE PREREQUISITES

Students must be admitted to the University of Minnesota's Master in Healthcare Administration Program or have consent of the instructor.

COURSE GOALS & OBJECTIVES

Specific goals and learning objectives are listed in for each class period.

METHODS OF INSTRUCTION AND WORK EXPECTATIONS

Each class will include a didactic presentation on the part of the instructor; significant issues will be identified and discussed, referencing the readings for the class period. There are no required readings for the course. The starred readings are a good starting point for students to begin exploring each topic. The amount that students learn in this course, and their performance on assignments, will depend to a large degree on the time and effort they devote to the readings for each topic. In most class periods, students will present or discuss results from individual or group assignments. Students will be expected to engage with the readings prior to class, participate in the discussion during class, and complete group and individual assignments as scheduled. Further readings are provided as starting points for students who wish to explore specific topics in greater depth and to assist in the completion of individual and group assignments.

COURSE TEXT & READINGS

COURSE OUTLINE/WEEKLY SCHEDULE

Week	Topic	Readings	Activities/Assignments
Week 1 - September 10, 17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evolution of Employer Involvement: Consistent Goals and Shifting Strategies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Readings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Presentation of Group Assignment 1 (10 pts.) – September 17
Week 2 - September 24	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Nature and Role of Health Plans 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none">
Week 3 - October 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Measuring Provider Performance: The Foundation of Purchaser Strategies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of Individual Assignment 1 (15 pts.)
Week 4 – October 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Using Benefit Design to Influence Consumers’ Choice of Providers and Use of Services 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none">
Week 5 – October 15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supporting Consumer Use of Quality and Cost Information for Provider Choice 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of Individual Assignment 2 (15 pts.)
Week 6 – October 22	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Providing Employees/Enrollees with Information to Use in Choosing Treatment Options 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none">
Week 7 – October 29	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Providing Programs That Help Employees/Enrollees Maintain and Improve Their Health 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none">
Week 8 – November 5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Providing Programs That Help Employees/Enrollees Manage Chronic Illnesses 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of Individual Assignment 3 (15 pts.)
Week 9 – November 12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provider Contracting and Payment Fundamentals 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none">
Week 10 – November 19	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Utilization Management Under Provider Contracting Arrangements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of Individual Assignment 4 (15 pts.)
Week 11 – November 26	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Moving Towards Value-based Payment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of Individual Assignment 5 (15 pts.)
Week 12 – December 3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New Payment Arrangements: Bundled/Episode-based Payment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of Individual Assignment 6 (15 pts.)
Week 13 – December 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New Payment Arrangements: Global Contracts and Population Health Management 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none">

SPH AND UNIVERSITY POLICIES & RESOURCES

The School of Public Health maintains up-to-date information about resources available to students, as well as formal course policies, on our website at www.sph.umn.edu/student-policies/. Students are expected to read and understand all policy information available at this link and are encouraged to make use of the resources available.

The University of Minnesota has official policies, including but not limited to the following:

- Grade definitions
- Scholastic dishonesty
- Makeup work for legitimate absences
- Student conduct code
- Sexual harassment, sexual assault, stalking and relationship violence
- Equity, diversity, equal employment opportunity, and affirmative action
- Disability services
- Academic freedom and responsibility

Resources available for students include:

- Confidential mental health services
- Disability accommodations
- Housing and financial instability resources
- Technology help
- Academic support

EVALUATION & GRADING

[Enter a detailed statement of the basis for grading here. Include a breakdown of course components and a point system for achieving a particular grade. Include expected turnaround time for grading/feedback. Please refer to the University's Uniform Grading Policy and Grading Rubric Resource at <https://z.umn.edu/gradingpolicy>]

Grading Scale

The University uses plus and minus grading on a 4.000 cumulative grade point scale in accordance with the following, and you can expect the grade lines to be drawn as follows:

% In Class	Grade	GPA
93 - 100%	A	4.000
90 - 92%	A-	3.667
87 - 89%	B+	3.333
83 - 86%	B	3.000
80 - 82%	B-	2.667
77 - 79%	C+	2.333
73 - 76%	C	2.000
70 - 72%	C-	1.667
67 - 69%	D+	1.333
63 - 66%	D	1.000
< 62%	F	

- A = achievement that is outstanding relative to the level necessary to meet course requirements.

- B = achievement that is significantly above the level necessary to meet course requirements.
- C = achievement that meets the course requirements in every respect.
- D = achievement that is worthy of credit even though it fails to meet fully the course requirements.
- F = failure because work was either (1) completed but at a level of achievement that is not worthy of credit or (2) was not completed and there was no agreement between the instructor and the student that the student would be awarded an I (Incomplete).
- S = achievement that is satisfactory, which is equivalent to a C- or better
- N = achievement that is not satisfactory and signifies that the work was either 1) completed but at a level that is not worthy of credit, or 2) not completed and there was no agreement between the instructor and student that the student would receive an I (Incomplete).

Evaluation/Grading Policy	Evaluation/Grading Policy Description
Scholastic Dishonesty, Plagiarism, Cheating, etc.	<p>You are expected to do your own academic work and cite sources as necessary. Failing to do so is scholastic dishonesty. Scholastic dishonesty means plagiarizing; cheating on assignments or examinations; engaging in unauthorized collaboration on academic work; taking, acquiring, or using test materials without faculty permission; submitting false or incomplete records of academic achievement; acting alone or in cooperation with another to falsify records or to obtain dishonestly grades, honors, awards, or professional endorsement; altering, forging, or misusing a University academic record; or fabricating or falsifying data, research procedures, or data analysis (As defined in the Student Conduct Code). For additional information, please see https://z.umn.edu/dishonesty</p> <p>The Office for Student Conduct and Academic Integrity has compiled a useful list of Frequently Asked Questions pertaining to scholastic dishonesty: https://z.umn.edu/integrity.</p> <p>If you have additional questions, please clarify with your instructor. Your instructor can respond to your specific questions regarding what would constitute scholastic dishonesty in the context of a particular class-e.g., whether collaboration on assignments is permitted, requirements and methods for citing sources, if electronic aids are permitted or prohibited during an exam.</p> <p>Indiana University offers a clear description of plagiarism and an online quiz to check your understanding (http://z.umn.edu/iuplagiarism).</p>
Late Assignments	[Instructor to set policy]
Attendance Requirements	[Instructor to set policy]
Extra Credit	[Instructor to set policy]
Intellectual Property of Instructors' Material	<p>The MHA program prohibits any current student from uploading MHA course content (e.g., lecture notes, assignments, or examinations for any PUBH 65XX or PUBH 75XX courses) created by a University of Minnesota faculty member, lecturer, or instructor to any crowdsourced online learning platform.</p>

CEPH KNOWLEDGE DOMAINS

Knowledge Domain	Course Learning Objectives	Assessment Strategies
Discuss the science of primary, secondary and tertiary prevention in population health including health promotion and screening.	To understand strategies and programs that employers use to support employees in choosing providers, choosing treatment options, managing chronic illnesses, and maintaining wellness.	Individual and group (oral and written) assignments.
Explain the social, political and economic determinants of health on population health and health inequities.	To understand employer and health plan programs and payment approaches as they impact population health.	Individual assignments.

NCHL HEALTHCARE LEADERSHIP COMPETENCIES FOR CAHME ACCREDITATION PURPOSES

Competency	Course Learning Objectives	Assessment Strategies
Knowledge of Population Health, Healthcare Delivery and Financing.	To understand the role that employers and health plans play in maintaining the health of their employees, influencing the delivery of care, and paying for care in the U.S. healthcare system.	Individual and group (oral and written) assignments.
	To understand the challenges of measuring health care quality and using measures to improve dimensions of quality of health care delivery.	Individual assignments.
	To understand the design and implementation of payment strategies to support and encourage value-based care.	Individual assignments.
Professionalism	To enhance ability to use written and oral communications effectively.	Individual assignments.

OVERVIEW OF EMPLOYER/HEALTH PLAN ROLES IN HEALTH SYSTEM

September 10, 17, 2018

Evolution of Employer Involvement: Consistent Goals and Shifting Strategies

The two-decade period from the mid-1970s through the mid-1990s marked the ascendancy of a particular type of health plan – the managed care organization – in the private health care marketplace and also as a contractor to Medicare and Medicaid. Responding to pressures from employers and government to control health care costs, these organizations (in collaboration with risk-bearing provider systems) instituted a variety of supply-side mechanisms, financial and non-financial, to influence provider behavior. Accompanying steps were taken to manage access to care on the part of plan enrollees. The result, eventually, was managed care backlash on the part of consumers and providers, precipitated in part by a redefinition by employers of their health benefit designs. In this first session, we will describe the transition over the past 15 years to a new “post backlash” employer paradigm for employee health benefits, emphasizing an expanded role for consumers, and more recently, an evolving “value-based” approach to paying providers

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe the origins and evolution of managed care organizations.
2. Explain the origins and nature of the managed care backlash of the 1990s, and its influence on the ongoing development of the new employer paradigm for health benefits.
3. Explain the factors influencing present employer demands on the health care system, and the impact of these demands on health plans, consumers, and America’s health care system as a whole.

Suggested Readings

The Evolution of Employer Involvement in Health Care

- 1.* Christianson JB. Managed care. *Encyclopedia of Health Economics*, Elsevier, United Kingdom, 2014. (posted on Moodle).
- 2.* Reinhardt UE. The illogic of employer-sponsored health insurance. *The New York Times*, July 1, 2014. http://www.nytimes.com/2014/07/03/upshot/the-illogic-of-employer-sponsored-health-insurance.html?_r=0
- 3.* McLellan RK. Work, health, and worker well-being: Roles and opportunities for employers. *Health Aff.* 2017;36(2):206-213. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/36/2/toc>
- 4.* Warshawsky MJ, Biggs AG. Income inequality and rising health-care costs: A worker who today makes \$30,000 has had to forsake a 26% salary increase since 1999 as employer costs rise. *The Wall Street Journal*, October 6, 2014. <https://search.proquest.com/pdnwallstreetjournal/docview/1940549015/pagelevelImagePDF/AD60C32FA59F43BFFQ/1?accountid=14586>
5. Galvin RS. Still in the game — harnessing employer inventiveness in U.S. health care reform. *N Engl J Med.* 2008;359(14):1421-1423. <https://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp0805021>
6. Grover D. Costly drugs to weigh on U.S. employers’ expenses in 2018: survey. Reuters, September 18, 2017. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-healthcare-survey/costly-drugs-to-weigh-on-u-s-employers-expenses-in-2018-survey-idUSKCN1BT1FR>
7. Irwin N. Envisioning the end of employer-provided health plans. *The New York Times*, May 1, 2014. <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/05/01/upshot/employer-sponsored-health-insurance-may-be-on-the-way-out.html>
8. Levitz E. Amazon should not be in charge of solving our health-care crisis. *New York Magazine*, January 30, 2018. <http://nymag.com/daily/intelligencer/2018/01/amazon-shouldnt-be-in-charge-of-fixing-health-care.html>
9. Monga V, Johnson KS. Pressure to cut employee benefits threatens labor peace. *The Wall Street Journal*, June 30, 2015. <http://blogs.wsj.com/cfo/2015/06/30/pressure-to-cut-employee-benefits-threatens-labor-peace/>
10. State Health Access Data Assistance Center. State-level trends in employer-sponsored health insurance, 2011-2015. Author, February 2017. <http://shadac.org/publications/state-level-trends-employer-sponsored-health-insurance-2011-2015-chartbook-and-state>
11. Snowbeck C. Employer health costs rising faster in Minnesota. *Star Tribune*, May 7, 2018. <http://www.startribune.com/employer-health-costs-rising-faster-in-minnesota/481974291/>
12. Farr C. Employers don’t understand the ‘black box’ behind rising drug prices, and are fed up. *cnbc.com*, April 22, 2018. <https://www.cnbc.com/2018/04/22/rising-drug-prices-big-topic-at-national-business-of-health-conference.html>

Employer Strategies for Changing the Health Care System

- 1.* Galvin R, Milstein A. Large employers’ new strategies in health care. *N Engl J Med.* 2002;347(12):939-942. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/347/12>
- 2.* Christianson JB, Ginsburg PB, Draper DA. The transition from managed care to consumerism: a community-level status report. *Health Aff.* 2008;27(5):1362-1370. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/27/5/1362.full.pdf+html>
- 3.* Millenson ML. Paradigm, not pill: The new role of patient-centered care. NIHCM Foundation, February 2014. http://www.nihcm.org/pdf/Patient-Centered_Care_EV_Millenson_2014-1.pdf
- 4.* Hiltzik M. The myth of ‘consumer-driven healthcare’ comes to life again. *The Los Angeles Times*, December 14, 2015. <http://www.latimes.com/business/hiltzik/la-fi-mh-the-myth-of-consumer-directed-healthcare-20151214-column.html>
- 5.* Delbanco S, Caballero AE. The payment reform landscape: For employers, keep pushing ahead. *Health Aff. Blog*, April 21, 2017. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2017/04/21/the-payment-reform-landscape-for-employers-keep-pushing-ahead/>

6. Catalyst for Payment Reform. 2018 Aligned Sourcing & Contracting Toolkit. Author, 2018. <https://www.catalyze.org/product/2018-aligned-sourcing-contracting-toolkit/>
7. Sanger-Katz M. Employer health insurance: Often-hated, sometimes pioneering, and now on Amazon's radar. *The New York Times*, February 1, 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/02/01/upshot/employer-health-insurance-amazon-berkshire-hathaway.html>
8. Havighurst C. The health-care conspiracy of silence. *The Wall Street Journal*, February 7, 2018. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/1999069772?accountid=14586>
9. Orszag PR, Gluckman D. Orszag, Gluckman: The medical marketplace is changing fast. Bloomberg, April 10, 2018. <https://www.bloomberg.com/view/articles/2018-04-09/the-medical-marketplace-is-changing-fast>
10. Bernard TS. High health plan deductibles weigh down more employees. *The New York Times*, September 1, 2014. <https://www.nytimes.com/2014/09/02/business/increasingly-high-deductible-health-plans-weigh-down-employees.html>
11. Frost A, Newman D, Quincy L. Health care consumerism: can the tail wag the dog? *Health Aff. Blog*, March 2, 2016. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2016/03/02/health-care-consumerism-can-the-tail-wag-the-dog-2/>
12. Meyer H. Blog: Why consumerism is no panacea for our healthcare problems. *Modern Healthcare*, March 8, 2016. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20160308/BLOG/160309857>
13. Hancock J, Luthra S. Studies: Employer Costs Slow as Consumers Use Less Care, Deductibles Soar. *Kaiser Health News*, September 14, 2016. <http://khn.org/news/studies-employer-costs-slow-as-consumers-use-less-care-deductibles-soar/>
14. Peterson Center on Healthcare. New initiative to help employers become more effective purchasers of healthcare. Press Release, May 2, 2017. <http://petersonhealthcare.org/new-initiative-help-employers-become-more-effective-purchasers-healthcare>

The Role of Self-Insurance

- 1.* Weaver C, Mathews AW. One strategy for health-law costs: self insure. *The Wall Street Journal*, May 27, 2013. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/1355641943/fulltext/67705D6B9D264496PQ/1?accountid=14586>
- 2.* Freeman GA. Self-insurance options continue to draw employers. *HealthLeaders Media*, May 3, 2017. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/health-plans/self-insurance-options-continue-draw-employers>
1. Bazar E. For millions of insured Americans, state health laws don't apply. *Kaiser Health News*, November 16, 2017. <https://khn.org/news/for-millions-of-insured-americans-state-health-laws-dont-apply/>
2. Catalyst for Payment Reform. MYTHBUSTER: Employers are getting out of the business of buying health insurance. Author, December 19, 2017. <https://www.catalyze.org/employers-exchanges/>
3. Lucia K, Monahan C, Corlette S. Cross-cutting issues: factors affecting self-funding by small employers: views from the market. Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, April 2013. http://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/reports/issue_briefs/2013/rwjf405372
4. Cutler D. Building a better health care system: the work ahead. *JAMA Forum*, March 30, 2016. <http://newsatjama.jama.com/2016/03/30/jama-forum-building-a-better-health-care-system-the-work-ahead/>

Employer Perspectives on Health Care Reform

- 1.* Galvin R. How employers are responding to the ACA. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;374(7):604-606. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/374/7>
2. Furman J, Fiedler M. The Cadillac tax — a crucial tool for delivery-system reform. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;374(11):1008-1009. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/374/11>
3. Lemieux J, Moutray C. About the Cadillac tax. *Health Aff. Blog*, April 25, 2016. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2016/04/25/about-that-cadillac-tax/>
4. Antos J. Capping the tax exclusion will not destroy employer health insurance. *Forbes*, April 26, 2016. <http://www.forbes.com/sites/realspin/2016/04/26/capping-the-tax-exclusion-will-not-destroy-employer-health-insurance/print/>
5. Becker, AL. What 'repeal-replace' could mean for your employer health plan. *The CT Mirror*, January 5, 2017. <http://ctmirror.org/2017/01/05/what-an-obamacare-repeal-could-mean-for-those-with-employer-sponsored-insurance/>
6. Hancock J. Employers eye moving sickest workers to insurance exchanges. *Kaiser Health News*, May 7, 2014. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2014/may/07/shifting-employees-to-exchanges.aspx>

Further Readings

1. Tozzi J. Trump's health chief wants to change how doctors do business. Bloomberg, March 21, 2018. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2018-03-21/trump-s-health-chief-wants-to-change-how-doctors-do-business>
2. Wingfield N, Thomas K. Amazon, Berkshire Hathaway and JPMorgan team up to disrupt health care. *The New York Times*, January 30, 2018. <https://nyti.ms/2GuXbBp>
3. Blumenthal D. Employer-sponsored health insurance in the United States — origins and implications. *N Engl J Med*. 2006;355(1):82-88. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMhpr060703>
4. Blumenthal D. Employer-sponsored insurance — riding the health care tiger. *N Engl J Med*. 2006;355(2):195-202. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMhpr060704>
5. Robinson JC, Ginsburg PB. Consumer-driven health care: promise and performance. *Health Aff.* 2009;28(2):w272-w281. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/2/w272.full.pdf+html>

September 24, 2018

The Nature and Role of Health Plans

Health plans represent employer interests in the health care system, competing for contracts with employers. They structure their products and actions to gain and retain the business of employer clients, which is critical to their own financial success. In doing so, they provide a wide range of products and services in addition to traditional health insurance. In this session, we trace the development of the health insurance industry and describe its current state. We discuss market concentration, premium setting, and differences among health plan products; describe how plans are evaluated by employers and consumers; and discuss public perceptions of the health insurance industry.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe the structure of the health insurance industry and how it is changing.
2. Distinguish among different types of health plans and health plan products.
3. Explain how employers assess health plan performance and choose among health plans.
4. Identify major current issues relating to health plan performance from the perspective of employers and the public.

Suggested Readings

Overview of the Health Plan Industry

- 1.* Grant C. Why health insurers are the new 800-pound gorillas. *The Wall Street Journal*, March 22, 2016. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/1774998768/5B58C0AB8A754952PQ/1?accountid=14586>
- 2.* Archer D. Private insurance is bankrupting Americans: is Congress paying attention? *Health Aff. Blog*, June 26, 2012. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2012/06/26/private-insurance-is-bankrupting-americans-is-congress-paying-attention/>
- 3.* Morse S. Majority of employer-insured Americans are satisfied with their health plan. *Healthcare Finance News*, February 6, 2018. <http://www.healthcarefinancenews.com/news/majority-employer-insured-americans-are-satisfied-their-health-plan>
- 4.* Morse S. AHIP follows the money: Here are the factors driving insurance premiums higher. *Healthcare Finance News*, May 22, 2018. <http://www.healthcarefinancenews.com/news/ahip-follows-money-here-are-factors-driving-insurance-premiums-higher>
5. Schoen C, Collins SR. The big five health insurers' membership and revenue trends: Implications for public policy. *Health Aff.* 2017;36(12):2185-2194. <https://www.healthaffairs.org/doi/pdf/10.1377/hlthaff.2017.0858>
6. Weixel N. UnitedHealth expects \$1.7B windfall from tax law. *The Hill*, January 16, 2018. <http://thehill.com/policy/healthcare/369147-unitedhealth-expects-17b-windfall-from-tax-law>
7. Japsen B. Anthem's new CEO looks to Medicare, technology investments for growth. *Forbes*, January 31, 2018. <https://www.forbes.com/forbes/welcome/?toURL=https://www.forbes.com/sites/brucejapsen/2018/01/31/anthems-new-ceo-looks-to-medicare-technology-investments-for-growth/&refURL=https://www.google.com/&referrer=https://www.google.com/>
8. Hetzel A.. Why Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan's nonprofit status is important to our members. *News Release, MI Blues Perspective*, March 1, 2018. <https://www.mibluesperspectives.com/news/why-blue-cross-blue-shield-of-michigans-nonprofit-status-is-important-to-our-members-2/>
9. Herman B. The health insurance industry's identity crisis. *Business Insurance*, February 1, 2016. <http://www.businessinsurance.com/article/20160201/NEWS03/160209990/the-health-insurance-industrys-identity-crisis>
10. Mangan D. Obamacare's Medicaid expansion leading to health insurance boom in some states. *CNBC*, July 20, 2016. <http://www.cnn.com/2016/07/20/obamacares-medicaid-expansion-leading-to-health-insurance-boom-in-some-states.html>
11. Fellows J. Providers grade health plans. Guess who still stinks. *HealthLeaders Media*, May 1, 2013. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/HEP-291713/Providers-Grade-Health-Plans-Guess-Who-Still-Stinks>
12. Armour S. UnitedHealth group exits health insurers' largest trade group. *The Wall Street Journal*, June 23, 2015. <http://www.wsj.com/articles/unitedhealth-group-exits-health-insurers-largest-trade-group-1435076375>
13. Terhune C. BlueShield of California will return \$50 million to customers. *The Los Angeles Times*, October 31, 2012. <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/oct/31/business/la-fi-blue-shield-credits-20121031>
14. Evans M. Big hospital operator retreats from health-insurance foray. *The Wall Street Journal*, December 15, 2016. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/big-hospital-operator-retreats-from-health-insurance-foray-1481814003>
15. Sommer J. Gripes about Obamacare aside, health insurers are in a profit spiral. *The New York Times*, March 18, 2017. <https://nyti.ms/2me5Thb>

Mergers and Acquisitions

- 1.* Dafny LS. Good riddance to big insurance mergers. *N Engl J Med.* 2017;376(19):1804-1806. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1616553>
- 2.* Abelson R. Failure of 2 health insurer mergers is unlikely to stop the efforts. *The New York Times*, July 20, 2016. http://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/21/business/failure-of-2-health-insurer-mergers-is-unlikely-to-stop-the-efforts.html?_r=0
3. Johnson CY. CVS-Aetna wants to be in your neighborhood because zip codes powerfully shape people's health. *The Washington Post*, March 26, 2018. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/wonk/wp/2018/03/26/cvs-aetna->

[wants-be-in-your-neighborhood-because-zip-codes-powerfully-shape-peoples-health/?noredirect=on&utm_term=.fd70fbf0254a](#)

4. The Times Editorial Board. CVS and Aetna say their massive merger is needed to keep prices down. That remains to be seen. *The Los Angeles Times*, December 11, 2017. <http://www.latimes.com/opinion/editorials/la-ed-cvs-aetna-20171211-story.html>
5. Grant C. Anthem may win by sitting out wave of health insurance deals. *The Wall Street Journal*, April 6, 2018. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/anthem-may-win-by-sitting-out-wave-of-health-insurance-deals-1523016903>
6. Kutscher B. Cigna, Centene build population health management expertise with deals. *Modern Healthcare*, January 26, 2015. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20150126/NEWS/301269832>
7. Terhune C. Blue Shield's proposed acquisition of Care1st faces tough scrutiny. *The Los Angeles Times*, June 8, 2015. <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-blue-shield-deal-20150609-story.html>
8. Abelson R. With merging of insurers, questions for patients about costs and innovation. *The New York Times*, July 5, 2015. <http://www.nytimes.com/2015/07/06/business/with-merging-of-insurers-questions-for-patients-about-costs-and-innovation.html>
9. Quelch JA. Health insurance mergers put consumers last. *The Hill*, June 24, 2016. <http://www.thehill.com/blogs/congress-blog/healthcare/284730-health-insurance-mergers-put-consumers-last>
10. O'Donnell J. Hospitals, doctors funded consumer opposition to insurance mergers. *USA Today*, July 21, 2016. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/politics/2016/07/21/hospitals-doctors-funded-consumer-opposition-insurance-mergers/87387476/>

Competitive Strategies of Health Plans

Care Delivery

1. Snowbeck C. Future looks bright for startup insurer Bright Health. *StarTribune*, May 17, 2018. <http://www.startribune.com/startup-insurer-bright-health-getting-bigger/482967681/>
2. Weaver C. Health insurers opening their own clinics to trim costs. *Kaiser Health News*, May 4, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2011/may/04/insurers-turn-to-clinics-for-cost-control.aspx?referrer=search>
3. Snowbeck C. UnitedHealth's Optum Unit Makes Big Push into Urgent Care in Minnesota. *Star Tribune*, September 13, 2016. <http://www.startribune.com/unitedhealth-s-optum-unit-makes-big-push-into-urgent-care-in-minnesota/393327791/>
4. Coletta AV. Re-imagining care delivery: insights from Independence Blue Cross. *AHIP*, May 22, 2017. <https://www.ahip.org/re-imagining-care-delivery-insights-from-independence-blue-cross/>

Provider Collaborations

1. Dafny L. Does CVS—Aetna spell the end of business as usual? *The N Engl J Med*. 2018;378(7):593-595. <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp1717137>
2. Boulton G. Aurora and Anthem join to start a new insurance company. *Milwaukee-Wisconsin Journal Sentinel*, April 19, 2016. <http://www.jsonline.com/business/aurora-and-anthem-join-to-start-a-new-insurance-company-b99709919z1-376295801.html>
3. Snowbeck C. Allina-Aetna could shake up insurance market. *Star Tribune*, January 22, 2017. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1861215144/fulltext/6AFA52CED7F24F91PQ/1?accountid=14586>

Vertical Ingegation

1. Mathews AW, Walker J. Cigna deal shows being a health insurer isn't enough anymore. *The Wall Street Journal*, March 8, 2018. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/2012007854?accountid=14586>
2. Bray C. Cigna agrees to buy express scripts in latest health care deal. *The New York Times*, March 8, 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/03/08/business/dealbook/cigna-express-scripts.html>
3. Miller NS. Humana acquires Family Physicians Group in Orlando. *Orlando Sentinel*, April 10, 2018. <http://www.orlandosentinel.com/health/os-humana-acquires-family-physicians-group-20180410-story.html>
4. McCluskey PD. Experts puzzle over Partners-Harvard Pilgrim merger talks. *Boston Globe*, May 8, 2018. <https://www.bostonglobe.com/business/2018/05/08/partners-harvard-pilgrim-merger-could-face-obstacles-from-regulators-experts-predict/YP4uyY0nq8EttcYKkXODAI/story.html>
5. Freeman GA. Partners-Harvard Pilgrim motivated by data? *HealthLeaders Media*, May 9, 2018. <https://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/partners-harvard-pilgrim-merger-motivated-data>
6. Weaver C. Managed care enters the exam room as insurers buy doctor groups. *Kaiser Health News*, July 1, 2011. <http://khn.org/news/unitedhealth-insurers-buy-doctors-groups/>

Brand Enhancement

1. Lagasse J. Health plans offering phone, mobile help to those impacted by Hurricane Irma. *Mobihealthnews*, September 8, 2017. <http://www.mobihealthnews.com/content/health-plans-offering-phone-mobile-help-those-impacted-hurricane-irma>
2. O'Connor K. Insurer prepares to launch program to improve community health in Richmond. *Richmond Times-Dispatch*, September 24, 2017. http://www.richmond.com/life/health/insurer-prepares-to-launch-program-to-improve-community-health-in/article_6b0df921-839f-527e-9d14-08c8c4cfe0b9.html
3. Morse S. Payers rank member satisfaction as top priority, value-based care as last. *Healthcare Finance News*, April 11, 2018. <http://www.healthcarefinancenews.com/news/payers-rank-member-satisfaction-top-priority-value-based-care-last>

4. Kaiser Permanente. Press Release – Kaiser Permanente announces \$200 million impact investment, partners with U.S. mayors and CEOs to address housing stability. Author, May 18, 2018. <https://share.kaiserpermanente.org/article/kaiser-permanente-announces-200-million-impact-investment-partners-with-u-s-mayors-and-ceos-to-address-housing-stability/>
5. HealthPartners. Press Release – HealthPartners recognized as one of the top health systems in the country. Author, April 30, 2018. <https://www.healthpartners.com/hp/about/press-releases/recognized-as-one-of-the-top-health-systems-in-the-country.html>
6. Wall JK. WellPoint spends \$50M to burnish brand. Indianapolis Business News, September 17, 2012. <http://www.ijb.com/wellpoint-spends--50m-to-burnish-brand/PARAMS/article/36730>
7. Business Wire. Priority Health opens one-stop insurance shops throughout Michigan to better serve residents. October 11, 2013. <http://www.priorityhealth.com/about-us/press-room/releases/2013/information-centers-open>
8. Business Wire Humana announces new corporate social responsibility goals and issues report on recent progress. April 17, 2014. <http://humana.newshq.businesswire.com/press-release/current-releases/humana-announces-new-corporate-social-responsibility-goals-and-issues>
9. Business Wire. Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield working to improve health in our communities. Author, January 31, 2017. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20170131005226/en/Anthem-Blue-Cross-Blue-Shield-Working-Improve>
10. BlueCross BlueShield Minnesota. Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota announces new “future of health care” initiative. PR Newswire, April 17, 2017. <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/blue-cross-and-blue-shield-of-minnesota-announces-new-future-of-health-care-initiative-300440190.html>
11. Caramencio A. How UCare builds better relationships with members. AHIP Blog, June 14, 2017. <https://www.ahip.org/how-ucare-builds-better-relationships-with-members/>

Issues Relating to Health Plan Behavior and Performance

Coverage

- 1.* Andrews M. Some plans skew drug benefits to drive away patients, advocates warn. Kaiser Health News, July 8, 2014. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2014/july/08/some-plans-skew-drug-benefits-to-drive-away-patients-advocates-warn.aspx>
2. Allen M. Why your health insurer doesn’t care about your big bills. ProPublica, May 25, 2018. <https://www.propublica.org/article/why-your-health-insurer-does-not-care-about-your-big-bills>
3. Ornstein C. How insurers are finding ways to shift costs to the sick. *The New York Times*, September 17, 2014. <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/09/18/upshot/how-insurers-are-finding-ways-to-shift-costs-to-the-sick.html>
4. Reuters. LA doctors, patients sue Health Net for denying claims. Author, September 13, 2012. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/09/13/us-healthnet-lawsuit-idUSBRE88C19T20120913>

Profits

1. Snowbeck C. UnitedHealth Group hikes outlook after quarterly profit easily beats estimates. *StarTribune*, April 17, 2018. <http://www.startribune.com/unitedhealth-group-sees-profit-jumps-boosts-outlook/479981613/>
2. Murphy T. Aetna chairman, CEO compensation climbs 26 pct. Yahoo News, April 8, 2013. <https://www.yahoo.com/news/aetna-chairman-ceo-compensation-climbs-181858396.html?ref=gs>
3. Terhune C. CalPERS approves 7.2% increase in HMO rates as drug costs climb. *The Los Angeles Times*, June 18, 2015. <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-calpers-health-rates-20150618-story.html>
4. Lagasse J. Medical costs to accelerate in 2018, but only slightly, as cost trends stabilize, says PwC. Healthcare Finance News, June 13, 2017. <http://www.healthcarefinancenews.com/news/medical-costs-accelerate-2018-only-slightly-cost-trends-stabilize-says-pwc>
5. Bartolone P. Blue Shield again owes Californians millions in health care rebates. Kaiser Health News, November 1, 2016. <http://khn.org/news/blue-shield-again-owes-californians-millions-in-health-care-rebates/>

Operations

- 1.* Cohn J. How Blue Cross became part of a dysfunctional health care system. Kaiser Health News, March 8, 2010. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/columns/2010/march/030810cohn.aspx?referrer=search>
- 2.* Drew LW. Finding a path through the health insurance market gobbledygook. Kaiser Health News, April 21, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Stories/2011/April/22/insurance-black-hole.aspx>
3. HealthLeaders Media News. Only 10% of health plans nab top NCQA quality ratings. Author, September 26, 2016. <https://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/only-10-health-plans-nab-top-ncqa-quality-ratings>
4. Lazarus D. When health insurers play games, patients lose. *The Los Angeles Times*, April 17, 2014. <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-lazarus-20140418-column.html>
5. Mishak MJ. Drinks, junkets and jobs: How the insurance industry courts state commissioners. *The Washington Post*, October 2, 2016. https://www.washingtonpost.com/investigations/drinks-junkets-and-jobs-how-the-insurance-industry-courts-state-commissioners/2016/10/02/1069e7a0-6add-11e6-99bf-f0cf3a6449a6_story.html?utm_term=.0cbbab4a3df1
6. Appleby J. Lawsuit accuses Anthem Blue Cross of fraudulent enrollment practices. Kaiser Health News, July 9, 2014. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2014/july/09/anthem-lawsuit-over-enrollment-practices.aspx?referrer=search>

Collaborative Initiatives

- 1.* Blackmore CC, Mecklenburg RS, Kaplan GS. At Virginia Mason, collaboration among providers, employers, and health plans to transform care cut costs and improved quality. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(9):1680-1687. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/9/1680.full.pdf+html>

- 2.* Stiffler L. Boeing, health care providers join forces in bid to curb costs. Kaiser Health News, June 17, 2014. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Stories/2014/June/17/seattle-times-boeing-providers-join-in-bid-to-reduce-costs.aspx>
3. Baumgarten A, Hempstead K. New provider-sponsored health plans: Joint ventures are now the preferred strategy. *Health Aff. Blog*, February 23, 2018. <https://www.healthaffairs.org/doi/10.1377/hblog20180216.720494/full/>
4. Anderson C. Sutter and insurance giant Aetna hire industry veteran to lead joint venture. *The Sacramento Bee*, March 20, 2018. <http://www.sacbee.com/latest-news/article206049659.html>
5. Gilyard B. Healthy partnerships. How health care collaboration can improve quality and cut costs. *Twin Cities Business Magazine*, September 1, 2017. <http://tcbmag.com/news/articles/2017/september/healthy-partnerships>
6. O'Donnell C, Roumeliotis G. Walmart talking with Humana on closer ties; acquisition possible: sources. Reuters, March 29, 2018. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-humana-m-a-walmart/walmart-talking-with-humana-on-closer-ties-acquisition-possible-sources-idUSKBN1H53CQ>
7. Meyer H. Collaborative efforts can save money and improve care. Kaiser Health News, January 5, 2012. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2012/january/06/collaborative-efforts-can-save-money-and-improve-care.aspx>
8. Isham GJ, Zimmerman DJ, Kindig DA, Hornseth GW. HealthPartners adopts community business model to deepen focus on nonclinical factors of health outcomes. *Health Aff.* 2013;32(8):1446-1452. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/32/8.toc>

The Health Insurance Industry and Health Reform

- 1.* Cohn J. Obamacare is working, but some insurers are behaving badly. *New Republic*, July 10, 2014. <http://www.newrepublic.com/article/118638/obamacare-reduces-uninsured-some-insurers-behaving-badly>
- 2.* Cunningham PW, Cheney K. Why liberals are abandoning the Obamacare employer mandate. *Politico*, July 6, 2014. <http://www.politico.com/story/2014/07/obamacare-employer-mandate-108578.html>
3. Henry J. Kaiser Family Foundation. Analysis: Individual market insurers experienced their best financial year under the ACA in 2017, though subsequent political and policy changes complicate the outlook for future years. Author, May 17, 2018. <https://www.kff.org/health-costs/press-release/analysis-individual-market-insurers-experienced-best-financial-year-under-aca-in-2017-though-subsequent-political-policy-changes-complicate-outlook/>
4. Weaver C. Health insurers respond to reform by snapping up less-regulated businesses. Kaiser Health News, March 19, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2011/march/20/health-insurers-reform-business.aspx>
5. Pear R. Obama and insurers join to cut health care fraud. *The New York Times* online, July 25, 2012. <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/07/26/us/politics/obama-and-insurers-join-to-cut-health-care-fraud.html>
6. Abelson R. High-end health plans scale back to avoid Cadillac tax. *The New York Times*, May 27, 2013. http://www.nytimes.com/2013/05/28/business/cadillac-tax-health-insurance.html?pagewanted=all&_r=0
7. Gottlieb S. How the affordable care act is reducing competition. *The Wall Street Journal*, July 5, 2015. <http://www.wsj.com/articles/how-the-affordable-care-act-is-reducing-competition-1436136236>
8. Sanger-Katz M. The problem with G.O.P. plans to sell health insurance across state lines. *The New York Times*, August 31, 2015. http://www.nytimes.com/2015/09/01/upshot/the-problem-with-gop-plans-to-sell-health-insurance-across-state-lines.html?_r=0&mtref=www.bing.com&qwh=3A20D570B2637A05D198337E749275AC&qwt=pay

Further Readings

1. De La Merced MJ. Aetna agrees to buy Coventry in \$5.7 billion deal. *The New York Times* online, August 20, 2012. <http://dealbook.nytimes.com/2012/08/20/aetna-is-said-to-strike-deal-for-coventry-health-for-5-7-billion/>
2. Bray C, Abelson R. Aetna agrees to acquire Humana for \$37 billion in cash and stock. *The New York Times*, July 3, 2015. <http://www.nytimes.com/2015/07/04/business/dealbook/aetna-agrees-to-acquire-humana-for-37-billion-in-cash-and-stock.html>
3. Pear R. House hearing on insurers' mergers exposes health care industry divide. *The New York Times*, September 10, 2015. <http://www.nytimes.com/2015/09/11/us/house-hearing-on-insurers-mergers-exposes-health-care-industry-divide.html?mtref=www.bing.com&qwh=579D1AD1976EE26BCAE4211FB3842595&qwt=pay>
4. Davis R. How health plans are empowering consumers. AHIP Blog, March 21, 2017. <https://newsatjama.jama.com/2017/02/01/jama-forum-value-based-purchasing-time-for-reboot-or-time-to-move-on/https://www.ahip.org/how-health-plans-are-empowering-consumers/>
1. Andrews M. Appealing an insurer's denial is often a good strategy. Kaiser Health News, June 20, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Features/Insuring-Your-Health/Michelle-Andrews-on-appealing-insurers-denial.aspx>
2. eValue8 Health Care. eValue8 2009: Measuring progress toward value-based purchasing. <http://www.nbch.org/NBCH/files/ccLibraryFiles/Filename/000000000640/Evalue8%202009%20Annual%20Report.pdf>
3. Girion L. Health insurer tied bonuses to dropping sick policyholders. *The Los Angeles Times*, November 9, 2007. http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-insure9nov09_0_3065397_full_story?coll=la-home-center
4. Mattke S, VanBusum KR, Martsof G. Final report: evaluation of tools and metrics to support employer selection of health plans. The RAND Corporation, 2014. http://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RR327.html
5. Overland D. Blue Cross \$991M surplus draws criticism, fear of monopoly. *FierceHealthPayer*, August 10, 2012. <http://www.fiercehealthpayer.com/story/blue-cross-991m-surplus-draws-criticism-fear-monopoly/2012-08-10>
6. Reuters. LA doctors, patients sue Health Net for denying claims. September 13, 2012. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/09/13/us-healthnet-lawsuit-idUSBRE88C19T20120913>

7. Austin DA, Hungerford TL. The market structure of the health insurance industry. Congressional Research Service Report #R40834, April 8, 2010. <http://www.fas.org/sqp/crs/misc/R40834.pdf>
8. Nussbaum A. WellPoint to acquire Amerigroup for \$4.9 billion. Bloomberg, July 9, 2012. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2012-07-09/wellpoint-to-buy-amerigroup-for-4-9-billion-in-cash.html>

October 1, 2018

Measuring Provider Performance: The Foundation of Purchaser Strategies

Efforts on the part of health plans and employers to measure provider performance have intensified over the past decade, with performance measurement assuming a key role in almost all employer/health plan strategies. Health plans construct or employ measures of performance to: select providers for inclusion in networks; create tiered networks; structure provider incentive payments; and produce provider performance reports for their providers, members, and the general public. These measures also can be used in disease management and wellness programs. The way in which performance measures are constructed and used has been a point of contention between employers/health plans and providers as has the cost to providers of constructing measures. Consumers also have criticized these measures as lacking in relevance for their decision making. In this session, we describe the efforts of employers and health plans to measure provider performance, common issues in measure construction, the use of risk-adjustment techniques, and alternatives for attributing patients to providers.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe and contrast different approaches to performance measurement.
2. Discuss strengths and weaknesses of these approaches.
3. Discuss the role of risk adjustment techniques and how they are applied.
4. Discuss alternatives for attributing patients to providers for measurement purposes.
5. Contrast how measurement challenges differ for quality vs. cost/efficiency measures.
6. Discuss potential adverse consequences of performance measurement.

Suggested Readings

The Basics of Provider Performance Measurement

- 1.* Berenson, R.A., Pronovost, P.J., Krumholz, H.M. Achieving the potential of health care performance measures. Timely analysis of immediate health policy issues. Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, May 30, 2013. <http://www.rwjf.org/en/research-publications/find-rwjf-research/2013/05/achieving-the-potential-of-health-care-performance-measures.html>
- 2.* Berenson, R. Seven policy recommendations to improve quality measurement. *Health Aff. Blog*, May 22, 2013. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2013/05/22/seven-policy-recommendations-to-improve-quality-measurement/>
- 3.* National Quality Forum. The ABCs of measurement. http://www.qualityforum.org/Measuring_Performance/ABCs_of_Measurement.aspx
- 4.* Baker DW, Chassin MR. Holding providers accountable for health care outcomes. *Ann of Intern Med.* 2017;167:418-423. <http://annals.org/aim/fullarticle/2648599>
4. Doll H, Gentile B, Bush EN, Ballinger R. Evaluation of the measurement properties of four performance outcome measures in patients with elective hip replacements, elective knee replacements, or hip fractures. *Value in Health.* Published online April 12, 2018. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1098301518302390>
5. Pronovost, P.J., Lilford, R. A road map for improving the performance of performance measures. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(4):569-573. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/4/569.full.pdf+html>
6. Blumenthal, D., McGinnis, J.M. Measuring vital signs. An IOM report on core metrics for health and health care progress. *JAMA.* 2015;313(19):1901-1902. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=934052&direction=P>
7. Worth, T. Tracking healthcare metrics in the age of value-based payment, what to know. *Healthcare Finance*, May 18, 2015. <http://www.healthcarefinancenews.com/news/tracking-healthcare-metrics-age-value-based-payment-what-know>
8. Jha A. *JAMA Forum: Payment power to the patients.* news@JAMA, May 22, 2017. <https://newsatjama.jama.com/2017/05/22/jama-forum-payment-power-to-the-patients/>

Importance of Risk Adjustment in Performance Measurement

- 1.* DuGoff E, Bishop S, Rawal P. Hospital readmission reduction program reignites debate over risk adjusting quality measures. *Health Aff. Blog*, August 14, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/08/14/hospital-readmission-reduction-program-reignites-debate-over-risk-adjusting-quality-measures/>
2. Martin KE, Rogal DL, Arnold SB. Health-based risk assessment: Risk-adjusted payments and beyond. *AcademyHealth.* January 2004. <http://www.hcfo.org/pdf/riskadjustment.pdf>
3. Minnesota Department of Health. Quality reporting system risk adjustment assessment. Report to the Minnesota Legislature. March, 2017. <http://www.health.state.mn.us/healthreform/measurement/report/RiskAdjustmentAssessmentReportMar2017.pdf>

Examples:

1. Draaghtel K. Milliman advanced risk adjuster, MARA. Milliman, February 2010. <http://us.milliman.com/Solutions/Products/Milliman-Advanced-Risk-Adjusters/>

Challenges in Measuring Provider Quality

- 1.* Mathias JS, Baker DW. Developing quality measures to address overuse. *JAMA*. 2013;309(18):1897-1898. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=926917&direction=P>
- 2.* Berenson RA. Moving payment from volume to value: What role for performance measurement? Urban Institute, December 2010. <http://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/alfresco/publication-pdfs/412344-Moving-Payment-from-Volume-to-Value-What-Role-for-Performance-Measurement-.PDF>
- 3.* Porter ME, Larsson S, Lee TH. Standardizing patient outcomes measurement. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;374(6):504-506. <https://www.orthopeden.org/downloads/242/Standardizing%20Patient%20Outcomes%20Measurement.pdf>
- 4.* Wilensky G. JAMA Forum: The need to simplify measuring quality in health care. News@JAMA, May 2, 2018. <https://newsatjama.jama.com/2018/05/02/jama-forum-the-need-to-simplify-measuring-quality-in-health-care/>
3. Van Dyke M. How health care leaders should navigate quality reporting. *Hospitals & Health Networks*, September 19, 2017. <https://www.hhnmag.com/articles/8546-how-health-care-leaders-should-navigate-quality-reporting>
4. Penso J. A health care paradox: Measuring and reporting quality has become a barrier to improving it. *STAT News*, December 13, 2017. <https://www.statnews.com/2017/12/13/health-care-quality/>
5. Nyweide DJ, Weeks WB, Gottlieb DJ. Relationship of primary care physicians' patient caseload with measurement of quality and cost performance. *JAMA*. 2009;302(22):2444-2450. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=4491&direction=P>
6. Rosof B. The importance of accurate data in quality-of-care measurement (Editorial). *Ann Intern Med*. 2012;157(5):379-380. <http://annals.org/issue.aspx?journalid=90&issueID=24808&direction=P>
7. Conway PH, Mostashari F, Clancy C. The future of quality measurement for improvement and accountability. *JAMA*. 2013;309(21):2215-2216. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=927065&direction=P>
8. Jha A. Back to the future: volume as a quality metric. *JAMA Forum*, June 10, 2015. <http://newsatjama.jama.com/2015/06/10/jama-forum-back-to-the-future-volume-as-a-quality-metric/>
9. Casalino LR, Gans D, Weber R, et al. US physician practices spend more than \$15.4 billion annually to report quality measures. *Health Aff*. 2016;35(3):401-406. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/35/3.toc>
10. Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services. CMS and major commercial health plans, in concert with physician groups and other stakeholders, announce alignment and simplification of quality measures. CMS-gov, February 16, 2016. <https://www.cms.gov/Newsroom/MediaReleaseDatabase/Press-releases/2016-Press-releases-items/2016-02-16.html>

Examples:

- 1) Overland D. Minnesota health plan releases doctor ratings despite opposition. *FierceHealthPayer*, January 20, 2011. <http://www.fiercehealthpayer.com/story/minnesota-health-plan-releases-doctor-ratings-despite-opposition/2011-01-20>
- 2) Stefan MS, Pekow PS, Nsa W, et al. Hospital performance measures and 30-day readmission rates. *J Gen Intern Med*. 2013;28(3):377-385. <http://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs11606-012-2229-8.pdf>
- 3) Merkow RP, Ju MH, Chung JW, et al. Underlying reasons associated with hospital readmission following surgery in the United States. *JAMA*. 2015;313(5):483-495. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=932719&direction=P>
- 4) Zuckerman RB, Sheingold SH, Orav EJ, Ruhter J, Epstein AM. Readmissions, observation, and the hospital readmissions reduction program. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;374(16):1543-1551. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/374/16>

Challenges in Measuring Provider Prices, Costs and Efficiency

- 1.* Robinson RC, Williams T, Yanagihara D. Measurement of and reward for efficiency in California's pay-for-performance program. *Health Aff*. 2009;28(5):1438-1447. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/5/1438.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Painter MW, Chernew ME. Counting change: Measuring health care prices, costs, and spending. Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, March 2012. <http://www.rwjf.org/qualityequality/product.jsp?id=74078>
3. Berk M, Schur C. Having a baby: media confusion over charges, costs, and the benefits of insurance. *Health Aff*. Blog, August 6, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/08/06/having-a-baby-media-confusion-over-charges-costs-and-the-benefits-of-insurance/>
4. Japsen B. Health care's measurement pioneers tackle cost. Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, August 2014. http://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/reports/issue_briefs/2014/rwjf414952

Challenges in Measuring Patient Experience

- 1.* Browne K, Roseman D, Shaller D, Edgman-Levitan S. Analysis and commentary. Measuring patient experience as a strategy for improving primary care. *Health Aff*. 2010;29(5):921-925. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/29/5.toc>
2. Bachman JW. The problem with patient satisfaction scores. *Fam Pract Manag*. 2016;23(1):23-27. <https://www.clinicalkey.com/#!/browse/toc/1-s2.0-S1069564816X60017/null/journalIssue>

Unintended Consequences of Performance Measurement

1. Kupfer JM. The morality of using mortality as a financial incentive. Unintended consequences and implications for acute hospital care. *JAMA*. 2013;309(21):2213-2214. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=927065&direction=P>
2. Clark C. Kafkaesque value system unfairly penalizes doctor pay. *HealthLeaders Media*, August 25, 2014. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/FIN-307757/Kafkaesque-Value-System-Unfairly-Penalizes-Doctor-Pay>
3. Robbins A. The problem with satisfied patients. *The Atlantic*, April 17, 2015. <http://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2015/04/the-problem-with-satisfied-patients/390684/>

4. Teisberg E. The quality tower of Babel. *Health Aff. Blog*, April 13, 2015. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2015/04/13/the-quality-tower-of-babel/>

Further Readings

1. Higgins A, Zeddies T, Pearson SD. Measuring the performance of individual physicians by collecting data from multiple health plans: The results of a two-state test. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(4):673-681. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/4/673.full.pdf+html>
2. Hoefler TP, Hayward RA, Greenfield S, Wagner EH, Kaplan SH, Manning WG. The unreliability of individual physician report cards for assessing the costs and quality of care of a chronic disease. *JAMA.* 1999;281(22):2098-2105. <http://jama.amanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=4646&direction=P>
3. Mehrotra A, Adams JL, Thomas JW, McGlynn EA. Is physician cost profiling ready for prime time? RAND Research Brief, 2010. http://www.rand.org/pubs/research_briefs/RB9523/
4. Nelson EC, Gentry MA, Mook KH, Spritzer KL, Higgins JH, Hays RD. How many patients are needed to provide reliable evaluations of individual clinicians? *Med Care.* 2004;42(3):259-266. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdfplus/4640735.pdf?acceptTC=true>
5. Romano P, Hussey P, Ritley D. Selecting quality and resource use measures: a decision guide for community quality collaboratives. AHRQ Publication No. 09(10)-0073, May 2010. <http://www.ahrq.gov/qual/perfmeasguide/>
6. Scholle SH, Roski J, Adams JL, et al. Benchmarking physician performance: reliability of individual and composite measures. *Am J Manag Care.* 2008;14(12):829-838. <http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2008/2008-12-vol14-n12/Dec08-3781p833-838/>
7. National Committee on Quality Assurance. HEDIS measure development process. Desirable attributes of HEDIS. HEDIS life cycle. <http://www.ncqa.org/tabid/414/Default.aspx>
8. Dimick JB, Birkmeyer NJ, Finks JF, et al. Composite measures for profiling hospitals on bariatric surgery performance. *JAMA Surg.* 2014;149(1):10-16. <http://archsurg.amanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=76&issueid=929681&direction=P>
9. Damberg CL, Sorbero ME, Lovejoy SL, et al. *An Evaluation of the Use of Performance Measures in Health Care.* RAND Corporation, 2011. http://www.rand.org/pubs/technical_reports/TR1148.html
10. Milliman. Milliman Advanced Risk Adjuster (MARA): Predictive value of inpatient risk score. November 2011. <http://publications.milliman.com/periodicals/rsa/pdfs/milliman-advanced-risk-adjuster.pdf>
11. Higgins A, Veselovskiy G, McKown L. Provider performance measures in private and public programs: achieving meaningful alignment with flexibility to innovate. *Health Aff.* 2013;32(8):1453-1461. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/32/8/1453.full.pdf+html>
12. Romley JA, Hussey PS, de Vries H, Wang MC, Shekelle PG, McGlynn EA. Efficiency and its measurement: what practitioners need to know. *Am J Manag Care.* 2009;15(11):842-845. http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2009/2009-11-vol15-n11/AJMC_09Nov_Romley_842to845/
13. Schone E, Brown RW, Goodell S. Risk adjustment: what is the current state of the art, and how can it be improved. Policy Brief No. 25, Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Synthesis Project, July 2013. <http://www.rwjf.org/en/research-publications/find-rwjf-research/2013/07/risk-adjustment---what-is-the-current-state-of-the-art-and-how-c.html>

INFLUENCING CONSUMER BEHAVIOR

October 8, 2018

Using Benefit Design to Influence Consumers' Choice of Providers and Use of Services

Employers pursue a variety of benefit design options to influence consumer purchase decisions, such as cost-sharing, network design, coverage limitations, and incentives regarding plan choice. In this session, we describe these efforts, their implementation and evidence of their impacts.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Understand differences in health benefit designs and their influence on consumer use of services.
2. Discuss the pros and cons of limited and tiered provider networks.
3. Discuss common issues relating to health plan coverage limitations.
4. Describe the motivation for employers to offer access to health plans through private benefit exchanges.

Suggested Readings

Products Offered by Health Plans

- 1.* Kulkarni SS. FAQs on HSAs: The basics of health savings accounts. Kaiser Health News, November 9, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2011/november/04/frequently-asked-questions-on-health-savings-accounts.aspx>
- 2.* Altman D. The biggest health issue we aren't debating. *Axios*, November 22, 2018. <https://www.axios.com/the-biggest-health-issue-we-arent-debating-1513307069-5d314f06-a515-4049-98a1-a885cb5c6fa9.html>
- 3.* Frakt A. With sickest patients, cost sharing comes at a price. *The New York Times*, May 4, 2015. <http://www.nytimes.com/2015/05/05/upshot/with-sickest-patients-cost-sharing-comes-at-a-price.html>

4. Morse S. Number of consumers enrolled in health savings accounts, high deductible plans, jumps 8%. *Healthcare Finance News*, April 16, 2018. <http://www.healthcarefinancenews.com/news/number-consumers-enrolled-health-savings-accounts-high-deductible-plans-jumps-8>
5. Luthra S. When credit scores become casualties of health care. *Kaiser Health News*, May 9, 2018. <https://khn.org/news/when-credit-scores-become-casualties-of-health-care/>
6. RAND Corporation. Expanding consumer-directed health plans could help cut overall health care spending. Author, May 7, 2012. <http://www.rand.org/news/press/2012/05/07/index1.html>
7. Archer D. Private insurance is bankrupting Americans: is Congress paying attention? *Health Aff. Blog*, June 26, 2012. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2012/06/26/private-insurance-is-bankrupting-americans-is-congress-paying-attention/>
8. Evans M. Reform update: Patients' cost sensitivity worries some doctors. *Modern Healthcare*, August 13, 2014. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20140813/NEWS/308139965>
9. Lazarus D. How a \$500 UCLA hospital copay turned into a \$3,900 bill — for 1 injection. *The Los Angeles Times*, October 2, 2015. <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-lazarus-20151002-column.html>
10. Claxton G, Levitt L, Long M. Payments for cost sharing increasing rapidly over time. *Peterson-Kaiser Health System Tracker Insight Brief*, April 12, 2016. <http://www.healthsystemtracker.org/insight/payments-for-cost-sharing-increasing-rapidly-over-time/>
11. Stier J. Health insurers find back door to limit choice: column. *USA Today*, May 26, 2016. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/opinion/2016/05/26/health-insurance-coverage-prescriptions-drugs-icer-comparative-effectiveness-column/83868108/>
12. Abelson R. Trying to revive H.M.O., but without those scarlet letters. *The New York Times*, February 28, 2016. <http://nyti.ms/1LO4aAP>
13. J.D. Power. Concerns about not having enough health coverage drive down member satisfaction. Author, March 10, 2014. <http://www.jdpower.com/press-releases/2014-member-health-plan-study>
14. Helmchen LA, Brown DW, Lurie IZ, Lo Sasso AT. Health savings accounts: growth concentrated among high-income households and large employers. *Health Aff.* 2015;34(9):1594-1598. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/34/9.toc>
15. Sood N, Wagner Z, Huckfeldt P, Haviland AM. Price shopping in consumer-directed health plans. *Forum Health Econ Policy*. 2013;16(1):35-53. <http://www.degruyter.com/view/j/fhep.2013.16.issue-1/issue-files/fhep.2013.16.issue-1.xml>

Value-Based Benefit Designs

- 1.* Christianson J. Value based insurance design: Sense and sensibility. *Medica Research Institute*, November 11, 2016. <http://www.ajmc.com/contributor/medica-research-institute/2017/01/value-based-insurance-design-sense-and-sensibility>
- 2.* Fendrick AM, Chernew ME. Value based insurance design: maintaining a focus on health in an era of cost containment. *Am J Manag Care*. 2009;15(6):338-343. http://www.ajmc.com/journals/issue/2009/2009-06-vol15-n6/AJMC_09jun_FendrickC338_39_43
3. Thomson S, Schang L, Chernew ME. Value-based cost sharing in the United States and elsewhere can increase patients' use of high-value goods and services. *Health Aff.* 2013;32(4):704-712. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/32/4/704.full.pdf+html>
4. Hibbard JH, Greene J, Tusler M. Plan design and active involvement of consumers in their own health and healthcare. *Am J Manag Care*. 2008;14(11):729-736. <http://web.b.ebscohost.com/ehost/results?sid=2860169b-f400-48da-ac5b-a2f746b502b3%40sessionmgr112&vid=1&hid=118&bquery=JN+%22American+Journal+of+Managed+Care%22+AND+DT+20081101&bdata=JmRiPWFwaCZ0eXBIPTEmc2I0ZT1laG9zdC1saXZI>
5. Neumann PJ, Auerbach HR, Cohen JT, Greenberg D. Low-value services in value-based insurance design. *Am J Manag Care*. 2010;16(4):280-286. <http://web.ebscohost.com/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=3&sid=305e43bb-34cc-45e0-b3b0-f8d8288d48fa%40sessionmgr111&hid=127>
6. Gibson TB, Maclean JR, Chernew ME, Fendrick AM, Baigel C. Value-based insurance design: Benefits beyond cost and utilization. *Am J Manag Care*. 2015;21(1):32-35. <http://www.ajmc.com/journals/issue/2015/2015-vol21-n1>

Examples:

- 1)* Gibson TB, Wang S, Kelly E, et al. A value-based insurance design program at a large company boosted medication adherence for employees with chronic illnesses. *Health Aff* 2011;30(1):109-117. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/1/109.full.pdf+html>
2. Appleby J. Carrot-and-stick health plans aim to cut costs. *USA Today/Kaiser Health News*, March 11, 2010. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2010/march/11/value-based-health-insurance.aspx?referrer=search>
3. Chernew ME, Shah MR, Wegh A, et al. Impact of decreasing copayments on medication adherence within a disease management environment. *Health Aff.* 2008;27(1):103-112. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/27/1/103.full.pdf+html>

Tiered Networks, High Performance Networks, Narrow Networks, and Centers of Excellence

- 1.* The Incidental Economist. If plans are only offering narrow networks, blame information asymmetry. Author, May 29, 2014. <http://theincidentaleconomist.com/wordpress/if-plans-are-only-offering-narrow-networks-blame-information-asymmetry/>
- 2.* Andrews M. Warning: opting out of your insurance plan's provider network is risky. *Kaiser Health News*, March 18, 2014. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2014/march/18/michelle-andrews-opting-out-insurer-provider-network-risky.aspx>

- 3.* Adler L, Hall M, Brandt C, Ginsburg PB, Lieberman S. Stopping surprise medical bills: federal action is needed. *Health Aff. Blog*, February 1, 2017. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2017/02/01/stopping-surprise-medical-bills-federal-action-is-needed/>
 4. Appleby J. Need a medical procedure? Pick the right provider and get cash back. Kaiser Health News, March 5, 2018. <https://khn.org/news/need-a-medical-procedure-pick-the-right-provider-and-get-cash-back/>
 5. Cooper Z, Morton FS. Out-of-network emergency-physician bills — An unwelcome surprise. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;375(20):1915-1918. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/375/20>
 6. Kyanko KA, Curry LA, Busch SH. Out-of-network physicians: How prevalent are involuntary use and cost transparency? *Health Serv Res*. 2013;48(3):1154-1172. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1475-6773.12007>
 7. Kliff S. He went to an in-network emergency room. He still ended up with a \$7,924 bill. Vox, May 23, 2018. <https://www.vox.com/2018/5/23/17353284/emergency-room-doctor-out-of-network>
 8. Rabin RC. Report faults high fees for out-of-network care. *The New York Times*, January 31, 2013. http://www.nytimes.com/2013/02/01/health/insurance-industry-report-faults-high-fees-for-out-of-network-care.html?_r=0
 9. Bindman A. JAMA Forum: Much ado about narrow networks. Newsatjama.jama.com, August 13, 2014. <http://newsatjama.jama.com/2014/08/13/jama-forum-much-ado-about-narrow-networks/>
 10. Blecker E. The impact of tiered physician networks on patient choices. HFCO Findings Brief, Vol. XLII, No. 3, September 2014. <http://www.hcfo.org/files/hcfo/HCFOfindingsBriefSept2014FINAL.pdf>
 11. Cohn J. Maybe you don't need a big doctor network to get good care. New Republic, September 8, 2014. <http://www.newrepublic.com/article/119359/narrow-networks-and-obamacare-consumers-may-be-better>
 12. Frakt A. Limiting choice to control health spending: a caution. *The New York Times*, September 15, 2014. <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/09/16/upshot/limiting-choice-to-control-health-spending-a-caution.html>
 13. Rosenthal E. Costs can go up fast when E.R. is in network but the doctors are not. *The New York Times*, September 28, 2014. http://www.nytimes.com/2014/09/29/us/costs-can-go-up-fast-when-er-is-in-network-but-the-doctors-are-not.html?_r=0
 14. Summer L. Health plan features: Implications of narrow networks and the trade-off between price and choice. AcademyHealth Research Insights Brief, December 10, 2014. <http://www.academyhealth.org/files/FileDownloads/RIBrief0315.pdf>
 15. Andrews M. Figuring out if a doctor is in your plan is harder than you think. Kaiser Health News, February 17, 2015. <http://khn.org/news/figuring-out-if-a-doctor-is-in-your-network-is-harder-than-you-think/>
 16. Cheney C. Out-of-network billing fuels provider-payer friction. HealthLeaders Media, August 31, 2015. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/out-network-billing-fuels-provider-payer-friction#>
 17. Pear R. Regulators urge broader health networks. *The New York Times*, November 8, 2015. http://www.nytimes.com/2015/11/09/us/regulators-urge-broader-health-networks.html?_r=0&mtref=www.bing.com&gwh=2522E81CED843852D370A83C6FD16D0E&gwt=pay
 18. Sinaiko AD. Variations in patient response to tiered physician network. *Am J Manag Care*. 2016;22(6):420-425. <http://www.ajmc.com/journals/issue/2016/2016-vol22-n6>
 19. Caspi H. Study Supports Surgery at High Quality Hospitals for Lower Overall Spending. Healthcare Dive, September 9, 2016. <http://www.healthcaredive.com/news/study-supports-surgery-at-high-quality-hospitals-for-lower-overall-spending/425971/>
 20. Hancock J. Insurers' flawed directories leave patients scrambling for in-network doctors. *The New York Times*, December 3, 2016. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1845483372/fulltext/4CC2A08B87BA4BB7PQ/1?accountid=14586>
 21. Sanger-Katz M, Abelson R. Surprise! Insurance paid the E.R. but not the doctor. *The New York Times*, November 16, 2016. <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/11/17/upshot/first-comes-the-emergency-then-comes-the-surprise-out-of-network-bill.html>
 22. Giovannelli J, Lucia K, Corlette S, et al. Regulation of health plan provider networks. *Health Aff. Health Policy Brief*, July 28, 2016. http://www.healthaffairs.org/healthpolicybriefs/brief.php?brief_id=160
 23. Millman J. Should you be able to see any doctor you want? *The Washington Post* Wonkblog, September 26, 2014. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/wonkblog/wp/2014/09/26/should-you-be-able-to-see-any-doctor-you-want/>
- Examples:**
- 1) Gonzales A. Cigna offering lower co-pays at its own clinics in Phoenix. *Phoenix Business Journal*, August 9, 2011. <http://www.bizjournals.com/phoenix/news/2011/08/09/cigna-offering-lower-co-pays-at-its.html?page=all>
 - 2) Andrews M. Some insurers paying patients who agree to get cheaper care. Kaiser Health News, March 26, 2012. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/features/insuring-your-health/2012/cash-rewards-for-cheaper-care-michelle-andrews-032712.aspx>
 - 3) Toland B. Highmark offers cheaper, UPMC-free plan. *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*, September 11, 2012. <http://www.post-gazette.com/stories/business/news/highmark-offers-cheaper-upmc-free-plan-652783/>
 - 4) Terhune C. Companies go surgery shopping. *The Los Angeles Times*, November 17, 2012. <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/nov/17/business/la-fi-bargain-surgery-20121117>

- 5) Business Wire. McKesson joins Employers Centers of Excellence Network. Author, March 31, 2014. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20140331005474/en/McKesson-Joins-Employers-Centers-Excellence-Network>
- 6) BusinessWire. Medica and Mayo Clinic introduce lower cost health plan. Author, October 6, 2014. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20141006006073/en/Medica-Mayo-Clinic-Introduce-Cost-Health-Plan>
- 7) Vesely R. Study: Quality, access not affected by covered California narrow networks. California Healthline, May 6, 2015. <http://www.californiahealthline.org/capitol-desk/2015/5/study-quality-access-not-affected-by-covered-california-narrow-networks>
- 8) Blue Cross Blue Shield. Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois and Advocate Health Care launch high performing network. Press Release, October 19, 2015. <http://www.bcbs.com/healthcare-news/plans/bcbsil-and-advocate-health-care-launch-high-performing-network.html?referrer=https://www.bing.com/>
- 9) Tomsic M. Some firms save money by offering employees free surgery. Kaiser Health News, April 22, 2016. <http://khn.org/news/some-firms-save-money-by-offering-employees-free-surgery/>
- 10) Becker AL. Yale medicine could leave Anthem's network Oct. 7. The CT Mirror, September 21, 2016. <https://ctmirror.org/2016/09/21/yale-medicine-could-leave-anthems-network-oct-7/>
- 11) Alltucker K. Thousands of Arizonans lose "in-network" insurance coverage at Dignity hospitals. *The Republic*, May 23, 2017. <http://www.azcentral.com/story/money/business/health/2017/05/23/health-net-customers-lose-access-dignity-health-hospitals-and-clinics/337416001/>
- 12) Sinaiko AD, Landrum MB, Chernen ME. Enrollment in a health plan with a tiered provider network decreased medical spending by 5 percent. *Health Aff.* 2017;36(5):870-875. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/36/5/toc>

Limiting Coverage

- 1.* Winslow R, Martin TW. Prostate-cancer therapy comes under attack. Some insurers stop covering expensive proton beams to battle prostate cancer. *The Wall Street Journal*, August 28, 2013. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1428388610/fulltext/429FC3C59450434APQ/1?accountid=14586>
- 2.* Hancock J. Check the fine print: some work-based health plans exclude outpatient surgeries. Kaiser Health News, January 25, 2016. <http://khn.org/news/check-the-fine-print-some-work-based-health-plans-exclude-outpatient-surgeries/>
3. Abelson R. Health insurer Centene is sued over lack of medical coverage. *The New York Times*, January 11, 2018. <https://nyti.ms/2Ft2qB0>
4. Silverman E. ALS patients losing time and hope as they wait for insurers to cover a pricey new drug. STAT News, May 21, 2018. <https://www.statnews.com/pharmalot/2018/05/21/als-patients-insurers-new-drug/>
5. Terhune C. Blue Shield of California to curb coverage of pricey cancer therapy. *Los Angeles Times*, August 28, 2013. <http://articles.latimes.com/2013/aug/28/business/la-fi-hospital-proton-beam-20130829>
6. Reuters. U.S. insurer to stop coverage of gynecological procedure. August 3, 2014. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2014/08/02/highmark-procedure-idUSL2N0Q801Y20140802>
7. Pfeifer S. Woman sues Anthem Blue Cross for refusing to cover hepatitis C drug. *Los Angeles Times*, May 18, 2015. <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-anthem-blue-cross-harvoni-lawsuit-20150518-story.html>
8. Levitz J, Kamp J. Biggest U.S. health insurer tightens rules on hysterectomy coverage. *The Wall Street Journal*, February 26, 2015. <http://www.wsj.com/articles/biggest-u-s-health-insurer-tightens-rules-on-hysterectomy-coverage-1424990877>

Private Health Insurance Exchanges

- 1.* Freeman GA. Private health insurance exchanges set to grow rapidly. HealthLeaders Media, April 26, 2017. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/health-plans/private-health-insurance-exchanges-set-grow-rapidly>
2. Alvarado A, Rae M, Claxton G, Levitt L. Examining private exchanges in the employer-sponsored insurance market. Kaiser Family Foundation Report, September 2014. <http://kff.org/private-insurance/report/examining-private-exchanges-in-the-employer-sponsored-insurance-market/>
3. Fronstin P. Private health insurance exchanges and defined contribution health plans: is it déjà vu all over again. Employee Benefit Research Institute, Issue Brief No. 373, July 2012. https://www.ebri.org/pdf/briefspdf/EBRI_IB_07-2012_No373_Exchs2.pdf
4. Tracer Z. Employers' shift to private health exchanges may cost employees more. *Insurance Journal*, April 7, 2015. <http://www.insurancejournal.com/news/national/2015/04/07/363490.htm>
5. Sammer J. Employers slow to adopt private health exchanges. Society for Human Resource Management, June 1, 2015. <https://www.shrm.org/hr-today/news/hr-magazine/Pages/0615-private-health-exchanges.aspx>
6. Zdechlik M. More health plan choices at work. What's the catch? Kaiser Health News, July 21, 2015. <http://khn.org/news/more-health-plan-choices-at-work-whats-the-catch/>
7. Livingston S. Cadillac tax driving private health insurance exchange enrollment. *Business Insurance*, June 29, 2015. <http://www.businessinsurance.com/article/20150629/NEWS03/150629832>

Examples:

- 1) Overland D. UnitedHealth, Cigna, HCSC to sell plans on Aon Hewitt exchange. *FierceHealthPayer*, September 27, 2012. <http://www.fiercehealthpayer.com/story/unitedhealth-cigna-hcsc-sell-plans-aon-hewitt-exchange/2012-09-27>
- 2) Overland D. Medica launches private exchange to sell ACO products. *FierceHealthPayer*, October 16, 2012.

- 3) <http://www.fiercehealthpayer.com/story/medica-launches-private-exchange-sell-aco-products/2012-10-16>
Overland D. 10 insurers to sell plans on Mercer's private exchange. FierceHealthPayer, April 17, 2013.
<http://www.fiercehealthpayer.com/story/aetna-cigna-unitedhealth-sell-plans-mercers-private-exchange/2013-04-17>
- 4) Principal Financial Group. The Principal signs private benefits exchange agreement. April 11, 2014.
<http://www.principal.com/about/news/2014/usis-private-exchange-041114.htm>
- 5) Abelson R. Companies test plans to cut their health costs. *The New York Times*, March 6, 2014.
<http://search.proquest.com/docview/1504721050/fulltext/365CCAC33B3749F8PQ/15?accountid=14586>

Further Readings

1. Cheney C. Narrow provider networks set to spread. HealthLeaders Media, July 15, 2014.
<http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/HEP-306360/Narrow-Provider-Networks-Set-to-Spread##>

October 15, 2018

Supporting Consumer on Quality and Cost Information for Provider Choice

Providing consumers with timely, useful information about the performance of providers is one way that purchasers hope to engage consumers. Their intent is that consumers use this information, in combination with financial incentives, to seek out lower cost, higher quality providers and to inform their conversations with providers. And, it is hoped that providers will improve their quality and reduce their costs when faced with public comparisons with their peers. The present health care system, some argue, does not provide information that is truly useful to consumers in making cost/quality tradeoffs when choosing providers, or that is credible to providers. Employers have been strong supporters of recent efforts to publicly report information comparing providers. We will describe these efforts as well as the evidence regarding the influence of this information on consumer and provider decisions.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe the recent efforts to increase the amount and quality of information available to health care consumers about providers.
2. Discuss the responses of providers to these efforts.
3. Assess the evidence regarding the impact of comparative provider performance data on consumer decisions, quality of care, and health care costs.

Suggested Readings

Production and Content of Public Reports

- 1.* Christianson JB, Shaw BW, Greene J, Scanlon DP. Reporting provider performance: What can be learned from the experience of multi-stakeholder community coalitions? *Am J Manag Care*. 2016;22:S382-S392.
<http://www.ajmc.com/journals/supplement/2016/af4q-summative-findings-and-lessons-learned/reporting-provider-performance>
- 2.* Christianson J. "They said what?": Patient-initiated internet reviews of physicians. Medica Research Institute, December 22, 2015. <http://www.ajmc.com/contributor/medica-research-institute/2017/01/they-said-what-patient-initiated-internet-reviews-of-physicians>
3. De Bramtes F, Delbanco S, Butto E, Patino-Mazmanian K, Tessitore L. Price transparency & physician quality report card 2017. Altarum/Catalyst for Payment Reform, November 8, 2017. <https://altarum.org/publications/price-transparency-and-physician-quality-report-card-2017>
4. Coburn T. Cross country: Shop around for surgery? Colorado may soon encourage it. *The Wall Street Journal*, May 5, 2018. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/2034652629?accountid=14586>
5. Kavanagh K. How to choose a hospital (spoiler: it's not getting any easier). *Lexington Herald Leader*, June 1, 2018. <http://www.kentucky.com/opinion/op-ed/article212390399.html>
6. Osborne NH, Ghaferi AA, Nicholas LH, Dimick JB. Evaluating popular media and internet-based hospital quality ratings for cancer surgery. *Arch Surg*. 2011;146(5):600-604.
<http://archsurg.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=76&issueID=5406&direction=P>
7. Galewitz P. Hospitals get into doctor rating business. Kaiser Health News Blog, April 17, 2014.
<http://capsules.kaiserhealthnews.org/index.php/2014/04/hospitals-get-into-doctor-rating-business>
8. Gray BM, Vandergrift JL, Gao G, et al. Website ratings of physicians and their quality of care. *JAMA Intern Med*. 2015;175(2):291-293. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueid=932716&direction=P>
9. Penzenstadler N. Surgeon scorecard measures docs by complications. *USA Today*, July 14, 2015.
<http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/2015/07/14/surgeons-scored-in-new-online-tool/30083213/>
10. Rau J. N.H., Calif. Seek to help consumers get details on health care prices. Kaiser Health News, March 9, 2016.
<http://khn.org/news/n-h-calif-look-to-help-consumers-get-details-on-health-care-prices/>
11. Evans M. Insurers reveal what healthcare providers are paid. *Modern Healthcare*, February 25, 2015.
<http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20150225/NEWS/302259967>
12. Sinaiko AD, Rosenthal MB. Examining a health care price transparency tool: who uses it, and how they shop for care. *Health Aff*. 2016;35(4):662-670. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/35/4.toc>

Examples

- 1)* Wayne A. UnitedHealth leads plan to reveal health prices to consumers. Bloomberg, May 14, 2014. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2014-05-14/unitedhealth-leads-plan-to-reveal-health-prices-to-consumers-1-.html>
- 2) PR Newswire. Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota announces the SmartSelect health care shopping tool to help Minnesotans make more informed health care choices. September 18, 2013. <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/blue-cross-and-blue-shield-of-minnesota-announces-the-smartselect-health-care-shopping-tool-to-help-minnesotans-make-more-informed-health-care-choices-224279251.html>
- 3) ConsumerReports. Is your hospital really as safe as you think? March 2014. <http://www.consumerreports.org/cro/2014/03/is-your-hospital-really-as-safe-as-you-think/index.htm>
- 4) Boulton G. New Wisconsin website rates medical clinics for quality. *Milwaukee-Wisconsin Journal Sentinel*, March 28, 2015. <http://www.jsonline.com/business/new-wisconsin-website-rates-medical-clinics-for-quality-b99470487z1-297914241.html>
- 5) Gillespie L. Coalition hopes to amp up push for health care transparency. Kaiser Health News, April 9, 2015. <http://khn.org/news/coalition-hopes-to-amp-up-push-for-health-care-transparency/>
- 6) Boulton G. Insurers' website provides price comparisons for medical procedures. *Journal Sentinel*, September 12, 2015. <http://www.jsonline.com/business/insurers-website-provides-price-comparisons-for-medical-procedures-b99575061z1-327146911.html>
- 7) HealthPartners. HealthPartners launches web feature to comparison shop for lowest cost medications. BusinessWire, October 25, 2017. <https://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20171025005916/en/HealthPartners-launches-web-feature-comparison-shop-lowest>

Concerns about Public Reports

- 1.* Sinaiko AD, Rosenthal MB. Increased price transparency in health care – challenges and potential effects. *N Engl J Med*. 2011;364(10):891-894. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1100041>
- 2.* Werner R, Asch D. The unintended consequences of publicly reporting quality information. *JAMA*. 2005;293(10):1239-1244. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=4967&direction=P>
- 3.* Burns EM, Pettengell C, Athanasiou T, Darzi A. Understanding the strengths and weaknesses of public reporting of surgeon-specific outcome data. *Health Aff*. 2016;35(3):415-421. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/35/3.toc>
- 4.* Ubel P. How price transparency could end up increasing health-care costs. *The Atlantic*, April 9, 2013. <http://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2013/04/how-price-transparency-could-end-up-increasing-health-care-costs/274534/>
- 5.* Jha AK. The stars of hospital care: Useful information or a distraction? *JAMA Forum*, April 20, 2016. <https://newsatjama.jama.com/2016/04/20/jama-forum-the-stars-of-hospital-care-useful-information-or-a-distraction/>
6. Kaplan K. Shopping for healthcare online? The odds are stacked against you. *Los Angeles Times*, December 8, 2017. <http://www.latimes.com/science/sciencenow/la-sci-sn-online-shopping-health-care-20171208-story.html>
7. Editorial. Considering potential benefits and consequences of hospital report cards: What are the next steps? *Health Serv Res*. 2015;50(2):321-329. <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/1475-6773.12280/epdf>
8. BusinessWire. U.S. News best hospitals rankings may be misleading, according to Comparion. May 7, 2013. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20130507005013/en/U.S.-News-Hospitals-Rankings-Misleading-Comparion>
9. Ostrow N. Hospital rankings show reputation more than quality, study says. Bloomberg Businessweek, April 19, 2010. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2010-04-19/hospitals-ranked-top-based-on-reputation-more-than-quality-study-says.html>
10. Lieber R. The web is awash in reviews, but not for doctors. Here's why. *New York Times* online, March 9, 2012. <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/03/10/your-money/why-the-web-lacks-authoritative-reviews-of-doctors.html?pagewanted=all>

Public Reports and Their Use by Consumers

- 1.* Hibbard JH, Greene J, Shoshanna S, Firminger K, Hirsh J. An experiment shows that a well-designed report on costs and quality can help consumers choose high-value health care. *Health Aff*. 2012;31(3):560-568. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/3/560.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Sinaiko AD, Eastman D, Rosenthal MB. How report cards on physicians, physician groups, and hospitals can have greater impact on consumer choices. *Health Aff*. 2012;31(3):602-611. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/3/602.full.pdf+html>
- 3.* Friedberg MW, Damberg CL. A five-point checklist to help performance reports incentivize improvement and effectively guide patients. *Health Aff*. 2012;31(3):612-618. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/3/612.full.pdf+html>
- 4.* Ranard BL, Werner RM, Antanavicius T. Yelp reviews of hospital care can supplement and inform traditional surveys of the patient experience of care. *Health Aff*. 2016;35(4):697-705. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/35/4.toc>
- 5.* Lee V. Transparency and trust — online patient reviews of physicians. *The N England Journal of Medicine* 2017;376(3):197-199. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/376/3>
6. Wu S-j, Sylwestrzak G, Chah C, DeVries A. Price transparency for MRIs increased use of less costly providers and triggered provider competition. *Health Aff*. 2014;33(8):1391-1398. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/33/8.toc>

7. Rau J. Few consumers are using quality, price information to make health decisions. Kaiser Health News, April 21, 2015. <http://khn.org/news/few-consumers-are-using-quality-price-information-to-make-health-care-decisions/>
8. Smart B. Shop for your surgeon using formerly confidential data. CNN, July 15, 2015. <http://www.cnn.com/2015/07/14/health/confidential-data-doctor-shopping/>
9. Findlay SD. Consumers' interest in provider ratings grows, and improved report cards and other steps could accelerate their use. *Health Aff.* 2016;35(4):688-696. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/35/4.toc>
10. Sun LH. You need surgery. So how do you find the right doctor? *The Washington Post*, July 20, 2015. http://www.washingtonpost.com/national/health-science/you-need-surgery-so-how-do-you-find-the-right-doctor/2015/07/20/0122e132-2a62-11e5-bd33-395c05608059_story.html
11. Rosenberg T. Shopping for health care: a fledgling craft. *The New York Times*, April 12, 2016. http://opinionator.blogs.nytimes.com/2016/04/12/shopping-for-health-care-a-fledgling-craft/?_r=0
12. Abelson R. Go to the wrong hospital and you're 3 times more likely to die. *The New York Times*, December 14, 2016. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1848801991/fulltext/978CB31C5AB34753PQ/1?accountid=14586>

Examples:

- 1) Mitchell R. Employers, unions jointly demand health care price transparency. KHN Blog, November 1, 2012. <http://capsules.kaiserhealthnews.org/index.php/2012/11/employers-unions-jointly-demand-health-care-price-transparency/>
- 2) Commins J. Consumer reports expands hospital ratings list. HealthLeaders Media, April 19, 2013. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/QUA-291310/Consumer-Reports-Expands-Hospital-Ratings-List>
- 3) Bernstein JRH, Bernstein J. Availability of consumer prices from Philadelphia area hospitals for common services: Electrocardiograms vs. parking. *JAMA Intern Med.* 2014;174(2):292-293. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueid=929736&direction=P>
- 4) Robert Wood Johnson Foundation. Working with Consumer Reports to educate consumers to make informed health care decisions. June 2014. http://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/reports/issue_briefs/2014/rwjf413645

Provider Responses to Public Reporting

- 1.* Watts LA, de Bocanegra HT, Darney PD, et al. In a California program, quality and utilization reports on reproductive health services spurred providers to change. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(4):852-862. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/4.toc>
- 2.* Smith MA, Wright A, Queram C, Lamb GC. Public reporting helped drive quality improvement in outpatient diabetes care among Wisconsin physician groups. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(3):570-577. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/3.toc>
2. Gold J. In era of increased competition, hospitals fret over ratings. Kaiser Health News, December 11, 2017. <https://khn.org/news/in-era-of-increased-competition-hospitals-fret-over-ratings/>
3. Mehrotra A, Hussey PS, Milstein A, Hibbard JH. Consumers' and providers' responses to public cost reports, and how to raise the likelihood of achieving desired results. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(4):843-851. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/4/843.full.pdf+html>
4. Reddy M. Doctors check online ratings from patients and make change. *Wall Street Journal*, May 19, 2014. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1525882682/fulltext/D4358A7B9B2249AEPQ/1?accountid=14586>
5. Frakt A. Price transparency is nice. Just don't expect it to cut health costs. *The New York Times*, December 19, 2016. https://www.nytimes.com/2016/12/19/upshot/price-transparency-is-nice-just-dont-expect-it-to-cut-health-costs.html?_r=0

Examples:

- 1)* Teleki S, Shannon M. In California, quality reporting at the state level is at a crossroads after hospital group pulls out. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(3):642-646. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/3/642.full.pdf+html>
- 2) Mathews AW. Compare and contrast when doctors are given a public report card, the resulting competition can serve patients well. *Wall Street Journal*, October 27, 2009. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052970204488304574431741881361528.html>
- 3) Chen PW. A report card for doctors. *New York Times*, June 16, 2011. <http://well.blogs.nytimes.com/2011/06/16/a-report-card-for-doctors/>
- 4) Associated Press. ACPE survey finds most physician leaders skeptical of online ratings. January 16, 2013. <http://www.ereleases.com/pr/acpe-survey-finds-physician-leaders-skeptical-online-ratings-97316>
- 5) Tu H, Gourevitch R. Moving markets: lessons from New Hampshire's health care price transparency experiment. California HealthCare Foundation and Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, April 2014. <http://www.chcf.org/publications/2014/04/moving-markets-new-hampshire>
- 6) Millman J. A reminder that not everyone loves more transparency for health-care prices. *Washington Post*, June 23, 2014. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/wonkblog/wp/2014/06/23/a-reminder-that-not-everyone-loves-more-transparency-for-health-care-prices/>

Medicare Reporting

1. Ryan AM, Nallamotheu BK, Dimick JB. Medicare's public reporting initiative on hospital quality had modest or no impact on mortality from three key conditions. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(3):585-592. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/3/585.full.pdf+html>
2. Hostetter M, Klein S. Quality matters. In focus: Medicare data helps fill in picture of health care performance. The Commonwealth Fund, April/May 2013. <http://www.commonwealthfund.org/Newsletters/Quality-Matters/2013/April->

[May/In-Focus.aspx](#)

3. O'Donnell J. Federal doctor ratings face accuracy, value questions, *USA Today*, September 29, 2014. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/nation/2014/09/29/obamacare-doctor-quality-ratings-accuracy-delay-affordable-care-act/16278733/>

Further Readings

1. Cutler D, Dafney L. Designing transparency systems for medical care prices. *N Engl J Med*. 2011;(10):364:894-895. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1100540>
2. Auerbach AD, Hilton JF, Maselli J, et al. Shop for quality or volume? Volume, quality, and outcomes of coronary artery bypass surgery. *Ann Intern Med*. 2009;150(10):696-704. <http://annals.org/issue.aspx?journalid=90&issueid=20182&direction=P>
3. Fox M. People like expensive health care, study finds. *National Journal*, March 5, 2012. <http://www.nationaljournal.com/healthcare/people-like-expensive-health-care-study-finds-20120305>
4. Hibbard J, Stockard J, Tusler M. Does publicizing hospital performance stimulate quality improvement efforts? *Health Aff*. 2003;22(2):84-94. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/22/2/84.full.pdf+html>
5. Hibbard JH, Stockard J, Tusler M. Hospital performance reports: impact on quality, market share, and reputation. *Health Aff*. 2005;24(4):1150-1160. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/24/4/1150.full.pdf+html>
6. Gance LG, Dick AW, Osler TM, Kellermann AL. Hospital quality: Does past performance predict future performance? *JAMA Surg*. 2014;149(1):16-17. <http://archsurg.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=76&issueid=929681&direction=P>
7. Hollenbeak CS, Gorton CP, Tabak YP, et al. Reductions in mortality associated with intensive public reporting for hospital outcomes. *Am J Med Qual*. 2008;23(4):279-286. <http://ajm.sagepub.com/content/23/4/279.full.pdf+html>
8. Sacks GD, Lawson EH, Dawes AJ, et al. Relationship between hospital performance on a patient satisfaction survey and surgical quality. *JAMA Surg*, published online June 24, 2015. <http://archsurg.jamanetwork.com/onlineFirst.aspx>
9. Rothberg MB, Morsi E, Benjamin EM, Pekow PS, Lindenauer PK. Choosing the best hospital: the limitations of public quality reporting. *Health Aff*. 2008;27(6):1680-1687. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/27/6/1680.full.pdf+html>
10. Harris KM, Buntin MB. Choosing a Health Care Provider: The Role of Quality Information, Research Synthesis Report No. 14. Princeton, NJ: The Synthesis Project, Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, May 2008. <http://www.rwjf.org/pr/product.jsp?id=29683>
11. Bebinger M. How much for an MRI? \$500? \$5,000? A reporter struggles to find out. *Kaiser Health News*, December 9, 2012. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2012/december/09/mri-cost-price-comparison-health-insurance.aspx>
12. Orszag PR. Let people shop for health care. *BloombergView*, October 21, 2014. <http://www.bloombergview.com/articles/2014-10-21/let-people-shop-for-health-care>
13. Frakt A, Carroll AE. If patients only knew how often treatments could harm them. *The New York Times*, March 2, 2015. http://www.nytimes.com/2015/03/03/upshot/if-patients-only-knew-when-more-information-means-less-treatment.html?_r=0&abt=0002&abg=0
14. Rosenberg T. Revealing a health care secret: the price. *The New York Times*, July 31, 2013. <http://www.lexisnexis.com/lncui2api/api/version1/getDocCui?lni=5918-5G51-JBKK-535B&csi=379740&hl=t&hv=t&hnsd=f&hns=t&hgn=t&oc=00240&perma=true>
15. Christianson JB, Volmar KM, Alexander J, Scanlon DP. A report card on provider report cards: current status of the health care transparency movement. *J Gen Intern Med*. 2010;25(11):1235-1241. <http://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs11606-010-1438-2.pdf>
16. Young GJ. Multistakeholder regional collaboratives have been key drivers of public reporting but now face challenges. *Health Aff*. 2012;31(3):578-584. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/3/578.full.pdf+html>
17. Evans M. Insurers reveal what healthcare providers are paid. *Modern Healthcare*, February 25, 2015. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20150225/NEWS/302259967>
18. Rau J. N.Y. hospital group turns the tables on hospital graders. *Kaiser Health News Blog*, November 4, 2013. <http://capsules.kaiserhealthnews.org/index.php/2013/11/n-y-hospital-association-turns-the-tables-on-growing-number-of-hospital-graders/>
19. Marchione M. Doctors propose tool to gauge cancer drugs' value. *St. Paul Pioneer Press*, June 22, 2015. http://www.twincities.com/nation/ci_28363093/doctors-propose-tool-gauge-cancer-drugs-value
20. Ginsburg P. Most health cost data of little use: opposing view. *USA Today*, March 5, 2013. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/opinion/2013/03/05/health-care-price-transparency-center-for-studying-health-system-change/1966039/>
21. Robert Wood Johnson Foundation. 'What's your price?' Many Americans seek health care prices, fewer compare across providers. Study Snapshot HCFO, May 2015. <http://www.hcfo.org/files/hcfo/HCFOStudySnapshotPrices.pdf>
22. Cheney C. Keys to price transparency success at health systems and hospitals. *HealthLeaders Media*, December 5, 2016. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/keys-price-transparency-success-health-systems-and-hospitals>

October 22, 2018

Providing Employees/Enrollees with Information to Use in Choosing Treatment Options

There is growing support for the need to provide consumers with information necessary to evaluate treatment options and select the option that is the best fit for their individual circumstances and preferences. Consumer decision aids have been

developed to address this issue. We discuss how decision aids function, evidence of their effectiveness, and the roles of employers and health plans in encouraging their use. We also discuss the challenges that low health literacy and numeracy pose for the use of shared decision making generally, and specifically how it relates to consumer choice of treatment options. We describe efforts by payers and health plans to address this issue.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe different approaches being used to support consumers in their choice of treatments.
2. Discuss the problems faced by employers and health plans in implementing decision aids.
3. Evaluate the evidence regarding the effectiveness of these decision aids.
4. Assess the challenges that low health literacy and numeracy pose for informed consumer decision making.

Suggested Readings

Shared Decision Making Overview

- 1.* RWJF Aligning Forces for Quality. Shared decision-making and benefit design: Engaging employees and reducing costs for preference-sensitive conditions. April 2013. <http://www.rwjf.org/en/research-publications/find-rwjf-research/2013/04/shared-decision-making-and-benefit-design.html>
- 2.* Balch A, Lakdawalla D. The case for patient-centered assessment of value. *Health Aff. Blog*, May 8, 2017. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2017/05/08/the-case-for-patient-centered-assessment-of-value/>
3. HealthDay. More patients are having a say in their medical care. Author, November 17, 2017. <https://consumer.healthday.com/general-health-information-16/doctor-news-206/more-patients-are-having-a-say-in-their-medical-care-728507.html>
4. Delbanco S, Delbanco T. Technology and transparency: Empowering patients and clinicians to improve health care value. *Ann Intern Med*. 2018;168:585-586. <file:///C:/Users/raasc001/Downloads/AIME201804170-M173269.pdf>
5. O'Connell K. Two arms, two choices: if only I'd known then what I know now. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(8):1895-1899. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/8.toc>
6. Brownlee S, Colucci J. The cost of assuming doctors know best. *The Atlantic*, September 28, 2012. <http://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2012/09/the-cost-of-assuming-doctors-know-best/262993/>
7. Rosenbaum L. How should doctors share impossible decisions with their patients. *The New Yorker*, July 3, 2013. <http://www.newyorker.com/tech/elements/how-should-doctors-share-impossible-decisions-with-their-patients>
8. Sadick B. Doctors see patients taking a greater role in their own care. *Chicago Tribune*, December 18, 2015. <http://www.chicagotribune.com/lifestyles/health/sc-doctor-patient-collaboration-health-1223-20151217-story.html>
9. Weiner SJ, Schwartz A, Sharma G, et al. Patient-centered decision making and health care outcomes. An observational study. *Ann Intern Med*. 2013;158(8):573-579. <http://annals.org/issue.aspx?journalid=90&issueID=926759&direction=P>

The Use of Decision Aids

- 1.* Mullan RJ, Montori VM, Shah ND, et al. The diabetes mellitus medication choice decision aid. *Arch Intern Med*. 2009;169(17):1560-1568. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueID=5741&direction=P>
2. Arterbum D, Wellman R, Westbrook EO, et al. Decision aids for benign prostatic hyperplasia and prostate cancer. *Am J Manag Care*. 2015;21(2):e130-e140. <http://www.ajmc.com/journals/issue/2015/2015-vol21-n2/Decision-Aids-for-Benign-Prostatic-Hyperplasia-and-Prostate-Cancer>
3. Rothberg MB, Sivalingam SK, Kleppel R, et al. Informed decision making for percutaneous coronary intervention for stable coronary disease. *JAMA Intern Med.*, published online May 18, 2015. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueid=934170&direction=P>
4. Tai-Seale M, Elwyn G, Wilson CJ, et al. Enhancing shared decision making through carefully designed interventions that target patient and provider behavior. *Health Aff.* 2016;35(4):605-612. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/35/4.toc>

Issues in Shared Decision Making

- 1.* Katz SJ, Hawley S. The value of sharing treatment decision making with patients. Expecting too much? *JAMA*. 2013;310(15):1559-1560. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=928054&direction=P>
- 2.* Frosch DL, May SG, Rendle KAS, Tietbohl C, Elwyn G. Authoritarian physicians and patients' fear of being labeled 'difficult' among key obstacles to shared decision making. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(5):1030-1038. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/5/1030.full.pdf+html>
- 3.* Krouss M, Croft L, Morgan DJ. Physician Understanding and Ability to Communicate Harms and Benefits of Common Medical Treatments. *JAMA Intern Med.*, published online August 29, 2016. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamainternalmedicine/fullarticle/2546153>
- 4.* Landro L. How to get patients to take more control of their medical decisions. *The Wall Street Journal*, February 28, 2017. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/how-to-get-patients-to-take-more-control-of-their-medical-decisions-1488164941>
5. Dickson V. CMS cancels second model aimed at shared decision-making. *Modern Healthcare*, February 5, 2018. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20180205/NEWS/180209950>
6. Carman KL, Maurer M, Yegian JM, et al. Evidence that consumers are skeptical about evidence-based health care. *Health Aff.* 2010;29(7):1400-1406. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/29/7/1400.full.pdf+html>
7. Krumholz HM. Variations in health care, patient preferences, and high-quality decision making. *JAMA*. 2013;310(2):151-152. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=927264&direction=P>

8. Ready T. Physicians 'missing the mark' on shared medical decisions. HealthLeaders Media, May 20, 2015. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/content/PHY-316543/Physicians-Missing-the-Mark-on-Shared-Medical-Decisions>
9. Gittlen S. The patient as care team member. HealthLeaders Media, November 23, 2015. http://healthleadersmedia.com/content.cfm?topic=QUA&content_id=323014
10. Balch A, Lakdawalla D. The case for patient-centered assessment of value. *Health Aff. Blog*, May 8, 2017. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2017/05/08/the-case-for-patient-centered-assessment-of-value/>
11. Heath S. Limited adoption limits patient portal decision aid efficacy. Patient EngagementHIT, May 11, 2017. <https://patientengagementhit.com/news/limited-adoption-limits-patient-portal-decision-aid-efficacy>
12. Rao A. Study: Decision aids show promise in reducing medical procedures. KHN Blog, September 5, 2012. <http://capsules.kaiserhealthnews.org/index.php/2012/09/study-decision-aids-show-promise-in-reducing-medical-procedures/>
13. Veroff D, Marr A, Wennberg DE. Enhanced support for shared decision making reduced costs of care for patients with preference-sensitive conditions. *Health Aff.* 2013;32(2):285-293. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/32/2.toc>
14. Kremer W. Do doctors understand test results? BBC News Magazine, July 6, 2014. <http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-28166019>

The Importance of Health Literacy, Numeracy, and Language Issues to Informed Choice

- 1.* Peters E, Hibbard J, Slovic P, Dieckmann N. Numeracy skill and the communication, comprehension, and use of risk-benefit information. *Health Affairs* 2007;26(3):741-748. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/26/3/741.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Schillinger D, Piette J, Grumbach K, et al. Closing the loop. Physician communication with diabetic patients who have low health literacy. *Archives of Internal Medicine* 2003;163(1):83-90. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueID=5422&direction=P>
- 3.* Klasco R, Glinert LH. 'What did the doctor say?': A simple question with a difficult answer. *The Washington Post*, January 14, 2018. https://www.washingtonpost.com/national/health-science/what-did-the-doctor-say-a-simple-question-with-a-difficult-answer/2018/01/12/29c6c5f2-d6e2-11e7-a986-d0a9770d9a3e_story.html?utm_term=.024f82e2631c
4. Khullar D. We're bad at evaluating risk. How doctors can help. *The New York Times*, April 17, 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/04/17/upshot/were-bad-at-evaluating-risk-how-doctors-can-help.html>
5. Gorman A. Say what? Many patients struggling to learn the foreign language of health insurance. Kaiser Health News, June 16, 2014. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2014/june/16/many-patients-struggling-to-learn-the-foreign-language-of-health-insurance.aspx>
6. Boodman SG. Helping patients understand their medical treatment. Kaiser Health News, March 1, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Stories/2011/March/01/Health-Literacy-Understanding-Medical-Treatment.aspx>
7. Crosby J. UnitedHealthcare takes initiative to enhance health literacy. *StarTribune*, May 17, 2014. <http://www.startribune.com/business/259562401.html>

Further Readings

1. Barclay E. Speaking the same language. Medical providers struggle to communicate with immigrant patients. *The Washington Post*, April 21, 2009, p. F.1. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/04/20/AR2009042002466.html>
2. Bavelly A. Health literacy is touted to improve patient roles. June 3, 2010. <http://www.computerizedscreening.com/about/news/06-07-2010/health-literacy-is-touted-to-improve-patient-roles>
3. Brownlee S. Giving patients a larger voice; more doctors welcome dialogue about tests and procedures. *The Washington Post*, October 23, 2007. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/10/19/AR2007101902620.html>
4. Health Dialog. Health Dialog releases testimony on health literacy. Press Release July 7, 2010. http://www.healthdialog.com/Utility/News/PressRelease/10-07-07/Health_Dialog_Releases_Testimony_on_Health_Literacy
5. Katz SJ, Howley ST. From policy to patients and back: surgical treatment decision making for patients with breast cancer. *Health Aff.* 2007;26(3):761-769. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/26/3/761.full.pdf+html>
6. PR Newswire. Limited health literacy increased safety risk for patients with diabetes. May 19, 2012. <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/limited-health-literacy-increases-safety-risks-for-patients-with-diabetes-94230884.html>
7. WiserTogether. Group Health Cooperative of Eau Claire implements WiserTogether's shared decision support platform. July 20, 2012. <http://www.wisertogether.com/news/2012/07/20/group-health-cooperative-of-eau-claire/>
8. Shedrofsky K. Study: Americans spend billions on non-conventional health approaches. *USA Today*, June 22, 2016. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/2016/06/22/study-americans-spend-billions-non-conventional-health-approaches/86200430/>

October 29, 2018

Providing Programs That Help Employees/Enrollees Maintain and Improve Their Health

Increasingly, employers are instituting programs and financial incentives that support employees in maintaining and improving their health. The expectation is that these efforts will reduce the rate of increase in health care costs over time by reducing or delaying the onset of chronic illnesses. Employers also hope that wellness programs will reduce absenteeism and increase worker productivity. Payers use both rewards and negative incentives to encourage healthy behaviors, and both health plans

and independent vendors deliver program content. The employer role in promoting these wellness programs has been controversial as it relates to use of positive versus negative incentives and the protection of personal employee information.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe the rationale for employer/health plan support for healthy lifestyle programs.
2. Assess the strengths and weaknesses of different program designs.
3. Evaluate the evidence that these programs have been successful in achieving their goals.
4. Discuss the impediments to the successful implementation of these programs.
8. Discuss the aspects of these programs that can make them controversial.

Suggested Readings

Healthy Lifestyle Programs – Overview

- 1.* Appleby J. Workers' poor health costs employers \$344 billion, study finds. KHN Blog, September 14, 2012. <http://capsules.kaiserhealthnews.org/index.php/2012/09/workers-poor-health-costs-employers-344-billion-study-finds/>
- 2.* Volpp KG, Asch DA, Galvin R, Loewenstein G. Redesigning employee health incentives — Lessons from behavioral economics. *N Engl J Med.* 2011;365(5):388-390. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1107285>
- 3.* Pollitz K, Rae M. Workplace wellness programs characteristics and requirements. The Henry J. Kaiser Family Foundation Issue Brief, May 2016. <http://files.kff.org/attachment/issue-brief-workplace-wellness-programs-characteristics-and-requirements>
4. Greenfield R. How testing workers' genes could make office wellness programs work. Bloomberg, February 1, 2016. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-02-01/testing-workers-genes-could-be-the-secret-to-making-wellness-programs-work>
5. Whiteman H. Few Americans engage in health behaviors that prevent chronic disease. Medical News Today, May 27, 2016. <http://www.medicalnewstoday.com/articles/310588.php>
6. Abraham J, White KM. Tracking the changing landscape of corporate wellness companies. *Health Aff.* 2017;36(2):222-228. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/36/2.toc>

Examples:

- 1) Cigna. Cigna says health assessment and coaching are key to reducing health risks; extends exclusive license with University of Michigan. August 16, 2011. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20110816006438/en/CIGNA-Health-Assessment-Coaching-Key-Reducing-Health>
- 2) Midwest Business Group on Health. New employer survey finds growing use of outcomes-based incentives, majority using either carrot or stick to motivate healthy employee behaviors. PRNewswire, May 7, 2013. <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/new-employer-survey-finds-growing-use-of-outcomes-based-incentives-majority-using-either-carrot-or-stick-to-motivate-healthy-employee-behaviors-206394381.html>
- 3) BusinessWire. Alere launches comprehensive coaching solution to help employers battle the causes of rising healthcare costs. September 30, 2014. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20140930005133/en/Alere-Launches-Comprehensive-Coaching-Solution-Employers-Battle>
- 4) Burke B. Asthma awareness: HCSC is investing in keeping kids healthy. AHIP, May 25, 2017. <https://www.ahip.org/asthma-awareness-hcsc-is-investing-in-keeping-kids-healthy/>

Evidence of Program Effectiveness

- 1.* Goetzel RZ. Do prevention or treatment services save money? The wrong debate. *Health Aff.* 2009;28(1):37-41. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/5/1532.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Russell LB. Preventing chronic disease: an important investment, but don't count on cost savings. *Health Aff.* 2009;28(1):42-45. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/1/42.full.pdf+html>
3. Carroll AE. Preventive care saves money? Sorry, it's too good to be true. *The New York Times*, January 29, 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/01/29/upshot/preventive-health-care-costs.html>
4. Kaplan K. To get smokers to quit, money works better than electronic cigarettes. *Los Angeles Times*, May 23, 2018. <http://www.latimes.com/science/sciencenow/la-sci-sn-quit-smoking-trial-20180523-story.html>
5. Mantzari E, Vogt F, Shemilt I, et al. Personal financial incentives for changing habitual health-related behaviors: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Prev Med.* 2015;75:75-85. http://ac.els-cdn.com/S0091743515000729/1-s2.0-S0091743515000729-main.pdf?_tid=5e093028-063a-11e5-9f42-00000aacb35e&acdnt=1432928526_9a608a362a898e69e4aaa8f447d5a074
6. Grover A. The danger of over-emphasizing preventive health care. *The Wall Street Journal*, February 19, 2015. <http://blogs.wsj.com/experts/2015/02/19/the-danger-of-over-emphasizing-preventive-health-care/>
7. Tavernise S. Study asks if carrot or stick can better help smokers stop. *The New York Times*, May 13, 2015. <http://www.nytimes.com/2015/05/14/health/study-asks-if-carrot-or-stick-can-better-help-smokers-stop.html>
8. Pho K. Do corporate wellness programs work? *USA Today*, September 9, 2013. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/opinion/2013/09/09/corporate-wellness-programs-column/2790107/>
9. Otto N. Connect the wellness dots. *Employee Benefit News*, September 14, 2015. <http://www.benefitnews.com/news/connecting-the-wellness-dots>

10. Kaiser Permanente. Kaiser Permanente study finds telephone wellness coaching helps members achieve significant weight loss. PR Newswire, January 26, 2017. <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/kaiser-permanente-study-finds-telephone-wellness-coaching-helps-members-achieve-significant-weight-loss-300396420.html>

Examples:

- 1)* Henke RM, Goetzel RZ, McHugh J, Isaac F. Recent experience in health promotion at Johnson & Johnson: lower health spending, strong return on investment. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(3):490-499. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/3/490.full.pdf+html>
- 2) Mattke S, Serxner SA, Zakowski SL, Jain AK, Gold DB. Impact of 2 employer-sponsored population health management programs on medical care cost and utilization. *Am J Manag Care.* 2009;15(2):113-120. <http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2009-02-vol15-n2/Feb09-3916p113-120/>
- 3) Thomas K. Companies get strict on health of workers. *The New York Times*, March 25, 2013. http://www.nytimes.com/2013/03/26/business/companies-offer-workers-more-incentives-for-health-changes.html?_r=0
- 4) Vestal C. Washington wellness plan beats the odds. *USA Today*, July 22, 2014. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/nation/2014/07/22/stateline-washington-wellness-health-employees/12987659/>
- 5) Priddle A. Experimental wellness plan is extended by Ford. *Detroit Free Press*, September 12, 2015. <http://www.benefitnews.com/news/connecting-the-wellness-dots>
- 6) HumanaVitality. HumanaVitality three-year impact study. (posted to Moodle) <http://press.humana.com/press-release/current-releases/three-year-study-shows-engagement-wellness-program-lowers-health-clai>

Concerns about Program Incentives

- 1.* Singer N. Rules sought for workplace wellness questionnaires. *The New York Times*, September 24, 2013. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1435728410/fulltext/177CCBF386CA4E9FPQ/1?accountid=14586>
- 2.* Horwitz JR, Kelly BD, DiNardo JE. Wellness incentives in the workplace: cost savings through cost shifting to unhealthy workers. *Health Aff.* 2013;32(3):468-476. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/32/3/468.full.pdf+html>
- 3.* Reuters. Coming soon to a workplace near you: 'Wellness or else'. *The New York Times*, January 13, 2015. <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-healthcare-wellness-insight-idUSKBN0KM17C20150113>
4. Pearson SD, Lieber SR. Financial penalties for the unhealthy? Ethical guidelines for holding employees responsible for their health. *Health Aff.* 2009;28(3):845-852. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/3/845.full.pdf+html>
5. Rogers T, Milkman KL, Volpp KG. Commitment devices: Using initiatives to change behavior. *JAMA.* 2014;311(20):2065-2066. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=930246&direction=P>
6. Hancock J. Workplace wellness programs put employee privacy at risk. Kaiser Health News, September 30, 2015. <http://khn.org/news/workplace-wellness-programs-put-employee-privacy-at-risk/>
7. Hancock J, Appleby J. 7 Questions to ask your employer about wellness privacy. Kaiser Health News, September 30, 2015. <http://khn.org/news/7-questions-to-ask-your-employer-about-wellness-privacy/>
8. Greenfield R. Why pay employees to exercise when you can threaten them? Bloomberg, February 15, 2016. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-02-15/why-pay-employees-to-exercise-when-you-can-threaten-them>
9. Patel MS, Asch DA, Volpp KG. Paying employees to lose weight. *The New York Times*, March 4, 2016. http://www.nytimes.com/2016/03/06/opinion/sunday/paying-employees-to-lose-weight.html?_r=0

Examples:

- 1)* USA Today. Not hiring smokers crosses privacy line. Editorial, January 29, 2012. <http://www.usatoday.com/news/opinion/editorials/story/2012-01-29/not-hiring-smokers-privacy/52874348/1>
- 2) Lerner M. Medica wants to put health coach between you and your bad habits; but critics say the voluntary, no-cost program is like health care big brother. *Star Tribune*, October 1, 2008. <http://www.startribune.com/lifestyle/29981699.html>
- 3) Knight VE. Treading carefully with wellness programs. *The Wall Street Journal*, July 28, 2009. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB124880470938287485.html>
- 4) Tuna C. Theory and practice: wellness efforts face hurdle — asking workers about family health history can clash with U.S. genetics law. *Wall Street Journal*, February 1, 2010. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748703822404575019790731232312.html>
- 5) Harris A. First wellness program firing suit filed by U.S. agency. Bloomberg, August 20, 2014. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2014-08-20/first-wellness-program-firing-suit-filed-by-u-s-agency.html>

The Case of Obesity

- 1.* Weiner JP, Goodwin SM, Chang H-Y, et al. Impact of bariatric surgery on health care costs of obese persons. *JAMA Surg.* 2013;148(6):555-561. <http://archsurg.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?articleid=1653574>
- 2.* Carroll AE. What we know (and don't know) about how to lose weight. *The New York Times*, March 26, 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/03/26/upshot/what-we-know-and-dont-know-about-how-to-lose-weight.html>
3. Finkelstein EA, Trogon JG, Cohen JW, Dietz, W. Annual medical spending attributable to obesity: payer-and service-specific estimates. *Health Aff.* 2009;28(5):w822-w831 (published online 27 July 2009). <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/5/w822.full.pdf+html>
4. Khan A. BMI mislabels 54 million Americans as 'overweight' or 'obese,' study says. *The Los Angeles Times*, February 4, 2016. <http://www.latimes.com/science/sciencenow/la-sci-sn-bmi-does-not-measure-health-20160204-story.html>
5. Kolata G. One weight-loss approach fits all? No, not even close. *The New York Times*, December 12, 2016. <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/12/12/health/weight-loss-obesity.html>

Examples:

- 1) Varney S. Obamacare insurance won't cover weight-loss surgery in many states. Kaiser Health News, May 27, 2013. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2013/may/27/bariatric-surgery-obesity-exchange-marketplace-mississippi.aspx>
- 2) Steenhuisen J. Hospital label no guarantee of better weight surgery. Reuters, April 20, 2009. <http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE53J5WL20090421>
- 3) Pollack A. FDA studies band surgery for less obese. *New York Times*, December 2, 2010, p. A.1. http://www.nytimes.com/2010/12/02/business/02obese.html?_r=0
- 4) Gardner A. Gastric bypass best for weight loss, study finds. Health.com, February 21, 2011. <http://news.health.com/2011/02/21/gastric-bypass-best-for-weight-loss-study-finds/>
- 5) Pittman G. Bariatric surgery doesn't reduce long-term costs. *Chicago Tribune*, July 16, 2012. http://articles.chicagotribune.com/2012-07-16/lifestyle/sns-rt-us-bariatric-costsbre86f13y-20120716_1_bariatric-surgery-weight-loss-surgery-durham-va-medical-center
- 6) Graham J. Doctors and Insurers are key to fighting obesity. Kaiser Health News, May 12, 2012. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2012/may/13/obesity-and-doctors.aspx>
- 7) Rundle RL. Obesity surgery is called cost-effective. *The Wall Street Journal*, September 8, 2008. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB122082794026608293.html>
- 8) Mincer J. Insight: firms to charge smokers, obese more for healthcare. Reuters, October 30, 2011. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/10/30/us-penalties-idUSTRE79T2S22011030>
- 9) Kwoh L. When your boss makes you pay for being fat. *The Wall Street Journal*, April 5, 2013. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424127887324600704578402784123334550.html>

Health Reform and Wellness

- 1.* Jost T. Implementing health reform: workplace wellness programs. *Health Aff. Blog*, May 29, 2013. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2013/05/29/implementing-health-reform-workplace-wellness-programs/>
2. Madison K, Schmidt H, Volpp KG. Smoking, obesity, health insurance, and health incentives in the Affordable Care Act. *JAMA*. 2013;310(2):143-144. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=927264&direction=P>

Further Readings

1. National Institute for Health Care Management. Building a stronger evidence base for employee wellness programs. Meeting Brief, May 2011. http://nihcm.org/images/stories/Wellness_FINAL_electronic_version.pdf
2. Slitt M. CIGNA earns new accreditation for wellness and health promotion programs from the National Committee for Quality Assurance (NCQA). News Release, November 9, 2009. http://newsroom.cigna.com/article_display.cfm?article_id=1126
3. Sutherland K, Christianson JB, Leatherman S. Impact of targeted financial incentives on personal health behavior. A review of the literature. *Med Care Res Rev*. 2008;65(Suppl to 6):36S-78S. http://mcr.sagepub.com/content/65/6_suppl/36S.full.pdf+html
4. Draper DA, Tynan A, Christianson JB. Health and wellness: the shift from managing illness to promoting health. Center for Studying Health System Change Issue Brief No. 121, June 2008. <http://www.hschange.com/CONTENT/989/>
5. Jauhar S. No matter what, we pay for others' bad habits. *New York Times*, March 30, 2010. http://www.nytimes.com/2010/03/30/health/30risk.html?_r=0
6. Huskamp HA, Rosenthal MB. Health risk appraisals: how much do they influence employees' health behavior? *Health Aff.* 2009;28(5):1532-1540. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/5/1532.full.pdf+html>

November 5, 2018

Providing Programs That Help Employees/Enrollees Manage Chronic Illnesses

Employers are strong supporters of programs that help employees self-manage care for chronic illnesses. The general idea is to place the consumer in a much more central role in medical care treatment. By educating consumers in appropriate treatment methods for their illnesses and supporting their efforts to manage their illnesses, payers and health plans hope that the progression of chronic illnesses can be delayed, and the number of acute flare-ups of chronic illnesses can be minimized. If successful, these efforts would improve the quality of life for employees, reduce emergency room and hospital use, and restrain growth in costs. In this session, we discuss efforts of payers and health plans to support consumers in chronic care management and the contexts in which they have been successful.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Explain the concepts of patient self-management and disease management in their different forms.
2. Discuss the various ways in which employers and health plans are supporting employees and plan enrollees in chronic illness management.
3. Assess the evidence of their effectiveness in various settings.
4. Describe the obstacles payers and health plans face when implementing programs to support chronic illness management by consumers.

Suggested Readings

Importance of Developing Effective Approaches to Chronic Illness Management

- 1.* Sklaroff S. On our own. Why we who struggle to live with diabetes could use a helping hand. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(1):236-239. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/1/236.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Nurmagambetov T, Kuwahara R, Garbe P. The economic burden of asthma in the United States, 2008-2013. *Ann Am Thorac Soc.* 2018;15(3):348-356. <https://www.atsjournals.org/doi/pdf/10.1513/AnnalsATS.201703-259OC>
- 3.* American Diabetes Association. Economic costs of diabetes in the U.S. in 2017. *Diabetes Care.* 2018;41(5):917-928. <http://care.diabetesjournals.org/content/early/2018/03/20/dci18-0007.full-text.pdf>
4. Enthoven AC, Mueller RJ, Weller C. (Opinion) – Costs related to chronic diseases threaten our health benefits and insurance. *cleveland.com*, June 3, 2018. https://www.cleveland.com/opinion/index.ssf/2018/06/costs_related_to_chronic_disea.html
5. Terhune C, Weintraub A. Take your meds, exercise—and spend billions. *BusinessWeek*, February 4, 2010. http://www.businessweek.com/magazine/content/10_07/b4166046292556.htm
6. Grens K. Half of heart patients don't stick to their meds. *Reuters*, July 25, 2012. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/07/25/us-heart-patients-meds-idUSBRE86O16M20120725>
7. Gillespie L. The health care system falls apart when you're a complex patient. *Kaiser Health News*, October 1, 2014. <http://kaiserhealthnews.org/news/the-health-care-system-falls-apart-when-youre-a-complex-patient/>

Disease Management Programs – Structure and Effectiveness

- 1.* Vojta D, De Sa J, Prospect T, Stevens S. Effective interventions for stemming the growing crisis of diabetes and prediabetes: a national payer's perspective. *Health Aff.* 31(1):20-26, 2012. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/1/20.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Mullainathan S. When a co-pay gets in the way of health. *The New York Times*, August 10, 2013. http://www.nytimes.com/2013/08/11/business/when-a-co-pay-gets-in-the-way-of-health.html?pagewanted=all&_r=0
- 3.* Williams BC. Limited effects of care management for high utilizers on total healthcare costs. *Am J Manag Care.* Published online May 7, 2015. <http://www.ajmc.com/journals/issue/2015/2015-vol21-n4/Limited-Effects-of-Care-Management-for-High-Utilizers-on-Total-Healthcare-Costs>
- 4.* Porter S. Researchers affirm long-term value of health coaching. *American Academy of Family Physicians*, June 1, 2016. <http://www.aafp.org/news/practice-professional-issues/20160601healthcoaching.html>
5. Bernstein J, Chollet D, Peterson GG. Disease management: does it work? *Mathematica Policy Research Inc. Issue Brief No. 4*, May 2010. <https://www.mathematica-mpr.com/our-publications-and-findings/publications/disease-management-does-it-work>
6. Mattke S, Higgins A, Brook R. Results from a national survey on chronic care management by health plans. *Am J Manag Care.* 2015;21(5):370-376. <http://www.ajmc.com/journals/issue/2015/2015-vol21-n5>

Examples:

- 1) Feder JL. Predictive modeling and team care for high-need patients at HealthCare Partners. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(3):416-418. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/3/416.full.pdf+html>
- 2) Lin WC, Chien HL, Willis G, et al. The effect of a telephone-based health coaching disease management program on Medicaid members with chronic conditions. *Med. Care* 2012;50(1):91-98. <http://ovidsp.tx.ovid.com/sp-3.8.1a/ovidweb.cgi?WebLinkFrameset=1&S=KIAOFPEMJODDDCAANCOKIHJJCIEPOAA00&returnUrl=ovidweb.cgi%3f%26TOC%3dS.sh.18.19.23.27%257c12%257c50%26FORMAT%3dtoc%26FIELDS%3dTOC%26S%3dKIAOFPEMJODDDCAANCOKIHJJCIEPOAA00&directlink=http%3a%2f%2fgraphics.tx.ovid.com%2fovftpdfs%2fFPDDNCJCIHAAJO00%2ffs047%2fovft%2flive%2fqv031%2f00005650%2f00005650-201201000-00012.pdf&filename=The+Effect+of+a+Telephone-based+Health+Coaching+Disease+Management+Program+on+Medicaid+Members+With+Chronic+Conditions.&link+from=S.sh.18.19.23.27%7c12&pdf+key=B&pdf+index=S.sh.18.19.23.27>
- 3) Andrews M. Group appointments with doctors: When three isn't a crowd. *Kaiser Health News*, March 19, 2013. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/features/insuring-your-health/2013/031913-michelle-andrews-on-group-patient-appointments.aspx>
- 4) Ramsey M. Ford adopts health management program. *The Wall Street Journal*, June 24, 2013. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424127887324183204578565503660688878.html>
- 5) Levingston SA. Going to the doctor in a group means better health for some patients. *The Washington Post*, June 2, 2018. https://www.washingtonpost.com/national/health-science/going-to-the-doctor-in-a-group-means-better-health-for-some-patients/2018/06/01/180a051c-47d6-11e8-9072-f6d4bc32f223_story.html?utm_term=.a4fc8150be45

Self-Management of Illnesses

- 1.* James J. Patient engagement. People actively involved in their health and health care tend to have better outcomes—and, some evidence suggests, lower costs. *Health Aff.* Health Policy Brief, February 14, 2013. http://healthaffairs.org/healthpolicybriefs/brief_pdfs/healthpolicybrief_86.pdf
- 2.* Bodenheimer T, Lorig K, Holman H, Grumbach K. Patient self-management of chronic disease in primary care. *JAMA* 2002;288(19):2469-2475. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=4856&direction=P>
3. Jerant A, Moore-Hill M, Franks P. Home-based, peer-led chronic illness self-management training: findings from a 1-year randomized controlled trial. *Ann Fam Med.* 2009;7(4):319-327. [https://www.clinicalkey.com/#!/BrowserCtrl/doBrowseTo/journalIssue/{facet:\[1-s2.0-S1544170909X6004X\].issn:15441709.contentType:Journals}](https://www.clinicalkey.com/#!/BrowserCtrl/doBrowseTo/journalIssue/{facet:[1-s2.0-S1544170909X6004X].issn:15441709.contentType:Journals})

4. Koven S. Why patients don't always follow doctor's orders. *The Boston Globe*, April 22, 2013. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1331048738/fulltext/76CF9D0C2D814754PQ/1?accountid=14586>

Further Readings

1. Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality, USDHHS. Asthma Return-on-Investment Calculator. User's Guide. <http://statesnapshots.ahrq.gov/asthma/UserGuide.jsp>
2. Conklin A, Nolte E. Disease management evaluation. A comprehensive review of current state of the art. RAND Technical Report, December 2010. http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/technical_reports/2011/RAND_TR894.pdf
3. Healthways well-being improvement solution. <http://www.healthways.com/solution/default.aspx?id=91>
4. Mattko S. Is there a disease management backlash? *Am J Manag Care*. 2008;14(6):349-350. <http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2008/2008-06-vol14-n6/Jun08-3297p349-350/>
5. Motheral BR. Telephone-based disease management: Why it does not save money. *Am J Manag Care* 2011;17(1):e10-e16. http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2011/2011-1-vol17-n1/AJMC_11jan_Motheral_WebX_e10/
6. Paez KA, Zhao L, Hwang W. Rising out-of-pocket spending for chronic conditions: a ten-year trend. *Health Aff*. 2009;28(1):15-25. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/1/15.full.pdf+html>
7. Reuters. Incentives and pharmacist coaches lead to improved health and lower health care costs for diabetic patients. May 7, 2009. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2009/05/07/idUS158325+07-May-2009+PRN20090507>
8. Draaghtel K. Predicting participation and savings. Using predictive modeling to identify patients for disease management. Milliman White Paper. <http://publications.milliman.com/periodicals/rsa/pdfs/predicting-participation-and-savings.pdf>

CONTRACTING WITH AND PAYING PROVIDERS

November 12, 2018

Provider Contracting and Payment Fundamentals

A major factor in health plans' success in securing employer contracts is their ability to negotiate favorable terms when contracting with providers and to effectively manage provider networks in ways that do not provoke enrollee backlash. In this session, we discuss the basics of provider contracting, including payment fundamentals and the way in which health plans and providers attempt to exert leverage in the contracting process.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe the basic reimbursement approaches used by health plans in contracting with providers.
2. Discuss the nature of the contracting process from the health plan and provider perspectives.
3. Describe areas of friction between providers and plans that arise during the contracting process.

Suggested Readings

Contents of Contracts between Providers and Health Plans

1. CIGNA (posted on Moodle)
2. Catalyst for Payment Reform. 2016 model health plan contract language on payment reform. http://www.catalyzepaymentreform.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=90

Payment Fundamentals

- 1.* Reinhardt UE. The options for payment reform in U.S. health care. *New York Times* online, February 17, 2012. <http://economix.blogs.nytimes.com/2012/02/17/the-options-for-payment-reform-in-u-s-health-care/>
- 2.* Center for Healthcare Quality & Payment Reform. The Payment Reform Glossary. 2015. (Posted on Moodle Site.) (<http://www.chqpr.org/downloads/paymentreformglossary.pdf>)
- 3.* Zuvekas SH, Cohen JW. Fee-for-service, while much maligned, remains the dominant payment method for physician visits. *Health Aff*. 2016;35(3):411-414. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/35/3.toc>
4. Berenson RA, Upadhyay DK, Delbanco SF, Murray R. Payment methods and benefit designs: how they work and how they work together to improve health care. Urban Institute and Catalyst for Payment Reform, April 2016. http://www.urban.org/research/publication/payment-methods-how-they-work/view/full_report
5. Berenson RA, Rich EC. US approaches to physician payment: the deconstruction of primary care. *J Gen Intern Med*. 2010;25(6):613-618. <http://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs11606-010-1295-z.pdf>
6. Berenson RA, Goodson JD. Finding value in unexpected places – fixing the Medicare physician fee schedule. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;374(14):1306-1309. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/374/14>

Health Plan/Provider Leverage in the Contracting Process

- 1.* Berenson RA, Ginsburg PB, Christianson JB, Yee T. The growing power of some providers to win steep payment increases from insurers suggests policy remedies may be needed. *Health Aff*. 2012;31(5):973-981. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/5/973.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Vladeck BC. Paradigm lost: Provider concentration and the failure of market theory. *Health Aff*. 2014;33(6):1083-1087. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/33/6.toc>
- 3.* Kocher B, Emanuel EJ. Overcoming the pricing power of hospitals. *JAMA*. 2012;308(12):1213-1214.

- <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=24967&direction=P>
- 4.* Ginsburg PB, Pawlson LG. Seeking lower prices where providers are consolidated: an examination of market and policy strategies. *Health Aff.* 2014;33(6):1067-1075. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/33/6.toc>
 5. Bailey M. Patients slammed with huge ambulance costs because insurers, ambulance companies can't negotiate contracts. *Managed Care Magazine*, November 29, 2017. <https://www.managedcaremag.com/dailynews/20171129/patients-slammed-huge-ambulance-costs-because-insurers-ambulance-companies-can-t>
 6. Terhune C, Ibarra AB. California takes on health giant over high costs. Kaiser Health News, April 1, 2018. <https://khn.org/news/california-sues-sutter-health-alleging-excessive-pricing/>
 7. Gottlieb JD, Shapiro AH, Dunn A. The complexity of billing and paying for physician care. *Health Aff.* 2018;37(4):619-626. <https://www.healthaffairs.org/doi/10.1377/hlthaff.2017.1325>
 8. Miller A. Deal tells health care giants to settle dispute or face state 'action.' Georgia Health News, April 16, 2018. <http://www.georgiahealthnews.com/2018/04/deal-tells-health-care-giants-settle-dispute-face-action/>
 9. Terhune C. California hospital giant Sutter Health faces heavy backlash on prices. Kaiser Health News, May 16, 2018. <https://khn.org/news/california-hospital-giant-sutter-health-faces-heavy-backlash-on-prices/>
 10. Melnick GA, Shen Y-C, Wu VY. The increased concentration of health plan markets can benefit consumers through lower hospital prices. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(9):1728-1733. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/9/1728.full.pdf+html>
 11. Bai G, Anderson GF. Variation in the ratio of physician charges to Medicare payments by specialty and region. *JAMA.* 2017;317(3):315-317. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/issue/317/3>
 12. Baker L, Bundorf MK, Royalty A. Private insurers' payments for routine physician office visits vary substantially across the United States. *Health Aff.* 2013;32(9):1583-1590. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/32/9/1583.full.pdf+html>
 13. Terhune C. Medical costs up to 20% higher at hospital-owned physician groups, study finds. *The Los Angeles Times*, October 21, 2014. <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-hospital-doctor-deals-20141022-story.html>
 14. Sun E, Baker LC. Concentration in orthopedic markets was associated with a 7 percent increase in physician fees for total knee replacements. *Health Aff.* 2015;34(6):916-921. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/34/6/916.full.pdf+html>
 15. Selden TM, Karaca Z, Keenan P, White C, Kronick R. The growing difference between public and private payment rates for inpatient hospital care. *Health Aff.* 2015;34(12):2147-2150. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/34/12.toc>
 16. Austin DR, Baker LC. Less physician practice competition is associated with higher prices paid for common procedures. *Health Aff.* 2015;34(10):1753-1760. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/34/10.toc>
 17. White C, Reschovsky JD, Bond AM. Inpatient hospital prices drive spending variation for episodes of care for privately insured patient. National Institute for Health Care Reform Research Brief #14, February 2014. <http://nihcr.org/analysis/improving-care-delivery/prevention-improving-health/episode-spending-variation/>
 18. Roberts ET, Chernew ME, McWilliams JM. Market share matters: evidence of insurer and provider bargaining over prices. *Health Aff.* 2017;36(1):141-148. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/36/1.toc>

Examples:

- 1) Merritt G. Children's Hospital, Anthem reach agreement after two-month standoff. *The CT mirror*, June 12, 2012. <http://ctmirror.org/2012/06/12/childrens-hospital-anthem-reach-agreement/>
- 2) Lund-Muzikant. Providence severs contract with Health Net just as employers consider options for 2013. *The Lund Report*, September 20, 2012. <http://www.thelundreport.org/resource/providence-severs-contract-with-health-net-just-as-employers-consider-options-for-2013>
- 3) Terhune C. Small surgeries, huge markups. *The Los Angeles Times*, January 31, 2013. <http://articles.latimes.com/2013/jan/31/business/la-fi-high-price-knee-20130131>
- 4) Aetna New Release. Aetna and Geisinger Health System reach new agreement. July 28, 2014. <http://news.aetna.com/news-releases/aetna-and-geisinger-health-system-reach-new-agreement/>
- 5) Rau J. A Tennessee insurer uses its monopoly to deliver bargain premiums. Kaiser Health News, August 6, 2014. <http://kaiserhealthnews.org/news/tennessee-blues-bargaining-power-means-lower-premiums/>
- 6) Alltucker K. Blue Cross Blue Shield dispute with hospital chains Abrazo, Carondelet could squeeze consumers. *The Arizona Republic*, December 4, 2015. <http://www.azcentral.com/story/money/business/2015/12/03/blue-cross-blue-shield-dispute-hospital-chains-abrazo-carondelet-could-squeeze-consumers/76751184/>
- 7) Terhune C. Major employers decry Sutter Health's tactics in dispute over prices. Kaiser Health News, April 7, 2016. <http://khn.org/news/major-employers-decry-sutter-healths-tactics-in-dispute-over-prices/>
- 8) Snowbeck C. Fairview, Blue Cross reach agreement on contract, retaining care for 250,000. *Star Tribune*, December 15, 2016. <http://www.startribune.com/fairview-blue-cross-reach-agreement-on-contract/406613936/>
- 9) Alltucker K. Thousands of Arizonans lose 'in-network' insurance coverage at Dignity hospitals. *The Arizona Republic*, May 23, 2017. <http://www.azcentral.com/story/money/business/health/2017/05/23/health-net-customers-lose-access-dignity-health-hospitals-and-clinics/337416001/>

Provider Issues Concerning Contracts with Health Plans

1. HealthDay News. Clauses in physicians' contracts can affect patient care. *Psychiatry Advisor*, March 10, 2016. <http://www.psychiatryadvisor.com/practice-management/doctors-employment-contracts-confidentiality-clauses-impact-professionalism/article/482064/>
2. Cheung K. AMA blasts insurers for costly 20 percent error rates. *FierceHealthcare*, June 20, 2011. <http://www.fiercehealthcare.com/story/ama-blasts-insurers-costly-20-percent-error-rate/2011-06-20>
3. Casalino, LP, Nicholson S, Gans DN, et al. What does it cost physician practices to interact with health insurance plans? *Health Aff* 2009;28(4):w533-w543 (published online 14 May). <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/4/w533.full.pdf+html?sid=36420c5a-9240-4639-b71c-0cf279227dc4>
4. Fuhrmans V. Insurers stop paying for care linked to errors; health plans say new rules improve safety and cut costs; hospitals can't dun patients. *The Wall Street Journal*, January 15, 2008. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB120035439914089727.html>

Examples:

- 1)* Cantlupe J Physicians, insurers clash over medical necessity in CA. *HealthLeaders Media*, September 27, 2012. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/PHY-284876/Physicians-Insurers-Clash-Over-Medical-Necessity-in-CA>
- 2) Aetna. Aetna ranked tops in connecting with doctors. May 25, 2011. <https://news.aetna.com/news-releases/aetna-ranked-tops-in-connecting-with-doctors/>
- 3) Toland B. Medical ethics focus of insurance dispute between UPMC and Highmark. *Pittsburgh Post-Gazette*, March 8, 2013. <http://www.post-gazette.com/stories/local/state/medical-ethics-focus-of-insurance-dispute-between-upmc-and-highmark-678402/>
- 4) Pfeifer S, Terhune C. USC hospital sues Kaiser over nonpayment of bill. *The Los Angeles Times*, May 23, 2014. <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-kaiser-usc-patient-fight-20140523-story.html>

Further Readings

1. Ellis P, Sandy LG, Larson AJ, Stevens SL. Wide variation in episode costs within a commercially insured population highlights potential to improve the efficiency of care. *Health Aff*. 2012;31(9):2084-2093. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/9/2084.full.pdf+html>
2. Terhune C. Cedars-Sinai and UCLA cut from Los Angeles health plan. *The Los Angeles Times*, September 21, 2012. <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/sep/21/business/la-fi-hospital-costs-20120921>
3. White C, Reschovsky JD, Bond AM. Understanding differences between high- and low-price hospitals: implications for efforts to rein in costs. *Health Aff*. 2014;33(2):324-331. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/33/2.toc>
4. Pacific Business Group on Health. Employers Centers of Excellence Network Program Summary. http://www.pbgh.org/storage/documents/ECEN_Program_Summary_314.pdf
5. Boulton G. Aurora-Anthem plan seeks exclusivity, promises savings. *Journal Sentinel*, October 24, 2012. <http://www.jsonline.com/business/auroraanthem-plan-seeks-exclusivity-promises-savings-0d7av36-175522981.html>
6. Appleby J. Domestic medical travel is taking off for surgery deals. *USA Today*, July 9, 2010. http://www.usatoday.com/money/industries/health/2010-07-07-travelforhealth07_CV_N.htm
7. Terhune C. Many hospitals, doctors offer cash discount for medical bills. *Los Angeles Times* online, May 27, 2012. <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/may/27/business/la-fi-medical-prices-20120527>
8. Anonymous. Regence selects Walgreens to provide specialty infusion medication services for members. Regence, July 22, 2013. <http://news.regence.com/releases/regence-selects-walgreens-to-provide-specialty-infusion-medication-services-for-members>
9. Frakt A. The future of health care costs: hospital-insurer balance of power. NIHCM Foundation, November 2010. <http://www.nihcm.org/component/content/article/407>
10. Abelson R. Hospitals and insurer join forces in California. *The New York Times*, September 17, 2014. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1562312161/fulltext/B3C17E9C09744CA8PQ/1?accountid=14586>
11. Ross C. Cleveland Clinic patient says \$30 co-pay turned into \$3,000 bill; feds to look harder at facility fees. *cleveland.com*, February 2, 2016. http://www.cleveland.com/healthfit/index.ssf/2016/02/cleveland_clinic_patient_says_30_co-pay_turned_into_3000_bill_feds_to_look_harder_at_facility_fees.html#incart_river_index

November 19, 2018

Utilization Management under Provider Contracting Arrangements

Reminders, clinical decision-support systems, predictive modeling, guidelines, and rules are all used by health plans to influence the amount and type of care that providers deliver to patients. Reminders prompt physicians about a patient's care needs prior to, or at the time of, the treatment visit. Clinical decision-support systems typically involve software designed to assist the physician's clinical decision-making. Predictive modeling uses large claims databases to identify patients who may be at risk of specific illnesses in the future and alert clinicians prior to the patient visit. Guidelines, or pathways, assist physicians in taking the appropriate treatment steps, given a patient's condition, and often are applied when treating patients with chronic health problems. They can be incorporated in clinical decision support systems. Rules are used by health plans to intervene more directly in the care process. This session will address the different ways that health plans attempt to influence the delivery of care by providers, including the manner in which these techniques are being employed and evidence of their effectiveness.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe the most common practices used by health plans to influence the delivery of care.
2. Explain the barriers to their effective implementation.
3. Assess the strength of the evidence supporting their effectiveness.
4. Describe recent trends in their use in conjunction with other efforts to influence physician behavior.

Suggested Readings

Utilization Management Challenges Faced by Health Plans (unnecessary care, wide variations across providers in service use, physician autonomy, lack of drug options, social barriers to care)

- 1.* Whoriskey P, Keating D. Spinal fusions serve as case study for debate over when certain surgeries are necessary. *The Washington Post*, October 7, 2013. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1446809447/fulltext/EEDCC92DBB1441E1PQ/1?accountid=14586>
- 2.* Ofri D. Adventures in 'prior authorization'. *The New York Times*, August 3, 2014. http://www.nytimes.com/2014/08/04/opinion/adventures-in-prior-authorization.html?_r=0
- 3.* Mostofian F, Ruban C, Simunovic N, Bhandari M. Changing physician behavior: what works? *Am J Manag Care*. 2015;21(1):75-84. <http://www.ajmc.com/journals/issue/2015/2015-vol21-n1>
- 4.* Tilbert JC, Wynia MK, Sheeler RD, et al. Views of US physicians about controlling health care costs. *JAMA*. 2013;310(4):380-389. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=927337&direction=P>
5. Freeman GA. Health plans should scrutinize lab, genetic testing for unneeded expenses. HealthLeaders Media, January 31, 2018. <https://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/health-plans-should-scrutinize-lab-genetic-testing-unneeded-expenses>
6. Freeman GA. Health plan spending declines with attention to social barriers. HealthLeaders Media, June 1, 2018. <https://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/health-plan-spending-declines-attention-social-barriers>
7. Editorial Board. What the Aetna scandal tells us about our healthcare system: It's a money pit. *Los Angeles Times*, February 14, 2018. <http://www.latimes.com/opinion/editorials/la-ed-aetna-claims-review-20180214-story.html>
8. Paton J. Glaxo's Advair is the \$100 billion asthma drug that won't die. Bloomberg, May 3, 2018. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2018-05-04/glaxo-s-advair-is-the-100-billion-asthma-drug-that-won-t-die>
9. Beckman HB. Lost in translation: physicians' struggle with cost-reduction programs. *Ann Intern Med*. 2011;154(6):430-433. <http://annals.org/issue.aspx?journalid=90&issueID=20228&direction=P>
6. Ofri D. Doctors' bad habits. *The New York Times*, October 5, 2013. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1439573436/fulltext/668B06E4998D494DPQ/1?accountid=14586>
7. Rosenbaum L. When is a medical treatment unnecessary? *The New Yorker*, October 23, 2013. <http://www.newyorker.com/tech/elements/when-is-a-medical-treatment-unnecessary>
8. Hancock J. Biggest insurer shocked with hepatitis C costs. Medpage Today, April 20, 2014. <http://www.medpagetoday.com/InfectiousDisease/Hepatitis/45341>
9. Andrews M. Insurers hesitant to cover many proton beam therapy treatments. Kaiser Health News, September 23, 2014. <http://kaiserhealthnews.org/news/insurers-hesitant-to-cover-many-proton-beam-therapy-treatments/>
10. O'Donnell J, Ungar L. Surgery costs vary wildly – even in same area. *USA Today*, January 21, 2015. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/2015/01/21/blue-cross-blue-shield-knee-hip-surgery-rates-vary-widely/21999929/>
11. Lewis A. The high cost of free checkups. *Huffington Post*, February 13, 2015. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/al-lewis/the-high-cost-of-free-che b_6562972.html
12. Ross C. Insurers pay twice as much as hospitals for hip and knee implants. STAT, February 28, 2017. <https://www.statnews.com/2017/02/28/insurers-orthopedic-implants/>
13. Murphy T. How do insurers decide what medicines to pay for? Associated Press, March 17, 2017. <https://apnews.com/0a94d0c12137470eb1787db87fabd75f/how-do-insurers-decide-what-medicines-pay>

Examples:

- 1)* Gardner A. Day of admission dictates length of stay for heart failure. ABC News, May 22, 2010. <http://abcnews.go.com/Health/Healthday/story?id=4904656&page=1>
- 2) Reinberg S. Too many unneeded brain scans for headaches, study suggests. HealthDay, March 17, 2014. <http://consumer.healthday.com/cognitive-health-information-26/brain-health-news-80/too-many-unneeded-brain-scans-for-headaches-study-suggests-685878.html>

Overview of Health Plan Efforts: End of Life Care, Care Coordination, Payment Denials, Post-Acute Care

- 1.* Landon BE, Rosenthal MB, Normand S-LT, Frank RG, Epstein AM. Quality monitoring and management in commercial health plans. *Am J Manag Care*. 2008;14(6):377-386. <http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2008/2008-06-vol14-n6/Jun08-3301p377-386/>
- 2.* McWilliams JM. Cost containment and the tale of care coordination. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;375:2218-2220. <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp1610821>
- 3.* McWilliams JM. Focusing on high-cost patients — the key to addressing high costs? *N Engl J Med*. 2017;376(9):807-809. <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp1612779>
2. CareCentrix. Optimizing post-acute care pathways: The new order for value-driven care. Author, 2018. <https://www.carecentrix.com/resources/whitepapers/optimizing-post-acute-care-pathways-new-order-value-driven-care>

3. Caramenico A. 4 examples of better end-of-life care. AHIP Blog, April 16, 2018. <https://www.ahip.org/4-examples-of-better-end-of-life-care/>
4. AHIP. Health care leaders collaborate to streamline prior authorization and improve timely access to treatment. Author, January 17, 2018. <https://www.ahip.org/health-care-leaders-collaborate-to-streamline-prior-authorization-and-improve-timely-access-to-treatment/>
5. Andrews M. Second opinions often sought but value is not yet proven. Kaiser Health News, May 26, 2015. <http://khn.org/search/Second+opinions+often+sought+but+value+is+not+yet+proven>
6. Galvin R, Brennan T. Can employers take a bigger role in controlling drug costs? *Health Aff. Blog*, February 17, 2017. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2017/02/17/can-employers-take-a-bigger-role-in-controlling-drug-costs/>

Examples:

- 1) Keim B. Paging Dr. Watson: artificial intelligence as a prescription for health care. *Wired*. October 16, 2012. <http://www.wired.com/wiredscience/2012/10/watson-for-medicine/>
- 2) MedSolutions. MedSolutions launches comprehensive post-acute care management project. March 28, 2013. <http://www.medsolutions.com/news/3-28-13.html>
- 3) MedeAnalytics. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Vermont selects MedeAnalytics' medical management analytics. April 30, 2013. <http://www.medeanalytics.com/news-events/blue-cross-blue-shield-of-vermont-selects-medeanalytics-medical-management-analytics>
- 4) Ravindranath M. Reston firm helps health-care providers ID high-risk patients. *The Washington Post*, August 23, 2013. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1427681318/fulltext/EDFFC4EB74664A74PQ/1?accountid=14586>
- 5) Snowbeck C. Medtronic sued by insurer Humana over infuse spinal product. *St. Paul Pioneer Press*, June 1, 2014. <http://www.lexisnexis.com/lxacui2api/api/version1/getDocCui?lni=5CBY-BT91-DYT4-V327&csi=313961&hl=t&hv=t&hnsd=f&hns=t&hgn=t&oc=00240&perma=true>
- 6) Millman J. How the nation's largest health insurer is fighting high drug prices. *The Washington Post*, March 30, 2015. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/wonkblog/wp/2015/03/30/how-the-nations-largest-health-insurer-is-fighting-high-drug-prices/>
- 7) Royle D. UnitedHealthcare pilot to curb lab costs draws protest. *Modern Healthcare*, May 2, 2015. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20150502/MAGAZINE/305029969>
- 8) Cheney C. Payer backlash may slow unnecessary spinal fusion surgeries. *HealthLeaders Media*, May 23, 2014. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/HEP-304825/Payer-Backlash-May-Slow-Unnecessary-Spinal-Fusion-Surgeries##>
- 9) Shen E, Koyama SY, Nuynh DN, et al. Association of a dedicated post-hospital discharge follow-up visit and 30-day readmission risk in a Medicare Advantage population. *JAMA Intern Med*. 2017;177(1):132-135. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamainternalmedicine/issue/177/1>
- 10) Hancock J. Former pharma reps' new mission: To school docs on high drug costs. *Kaiser Health News*, June 8, 2017. <http://khn.org/news/former-pharma-reps-new-mission-to-school-docs-on-high-drug-costs/>
- 11) Freeman GA. Patients will die from Anthem's policy denying ER payments, doctor says. *HealthLeaders Media*, January 24, 2018. <https://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/patients-will-die-anthems-policy-denying-er-payments-doctor-says>
- 12) Lazarus D. When your insurer denies a valid claim because of 'lack of medical necessity'. *Los Angeles Times*, January 23, 2018. <http://www.latimes.com/business/lazarus/la-fi-lazarus-healthcare-claim-denials-20180123-story.html>
- 13) Kliff S. An ER visit, a \$12,000 bill – and a health insurer that wouldn't pay. *Vox*, January 29, 2018. <https://www.vox.com/policy-and-politics/2018/1/29/16906558/anthem-emergency-room-coverage-denials-inappropriate>
- 14) Abelson R, Sanger-Katz M, Creswell J. As an insurer resists paying 'avoidable' E.R. visits, patients and doctors push back. *The New York Times*, May 19, 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/05/19/upshot/anthem-insurer-resists-paying-emergency-room-visits-if-avoidable.html>
- 15) Ingold J. Anthem won't pay for many patients to get CTs or MRIs at Colorado hospitals anymore. That's the wave of the future for health insurance. *Denver Post*, May 24, 2018. <https://www.denverpost.com/2018/05/24/anthem-colorado-hospitals-ct-mri-costs/>

Profiling/Feedback of Information on Treatment Patterns

- 1.* Dimick JB, Hendren SK. Hospital report cards: Necessary but not sufficient? *JAMA Surg*. 2014;149(2):143-144. <http://archsurg.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=76&issueid=929755&direction=P>
- 2.* Carroll AE. There's no magical savings in showing prices to doctors. *The New York Times*, June 12, 2017. <https://nyti.ms/2secXfe>
3. Glance LG, Osler TM, Mukamel DB. Effectiveness of nonpublic report cards for reducing trauma mortality. *JAMA Surg*. 2014;149(2):137-143. <http://archsurg.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=76&issueid=929755&direction=P>
4. Brown EC, Robicsek A, Billings LK, et al. Evaluating primary care physician performance in diabetes glucose control. *Am J Med Qual*. Published online April 28, 2015. <http://ajm.sagepub.com/content/early/2015/04/28/1062860615585138.full.pdf+html>
5. Fellows J. What happens when physicians know the total cost of care. *HealthLeaders Media*, May 28, 2015. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/content/PHY-316823/What-Happens-When-Physicians-Know-the-Total-Cost-of->

Care

6. Zuger A. A report card the doctor doesn't want to take home. *The New York Times*, September 14, 2015. http://well.blogs.nytimes.com/2015/09/14/a-report-card-the-doctor-doesnt-want-to-take-home/?_r=0
7. Zygorakis CC, Valencia V, Morlates C, et al. Association between surgeon scorecard use and operating room costs. *JAMA Surg*. doi:10.1001/jamasurg.2016.4674. Epub 7 Dec 2016. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamasurgery/fullarticle/2589764?resultClick=1>

Practice Guidelines

- 1.* Lin KW, Slawson DC. Identifying and using good practice guidelines. *Am Fam Phy*. 2009;80(1):67-69. [https://www.clinicalkey.com#!/BrowserCtrl/doBrowseTo/journalIssue/{facet:\[1-s2.0-S0002838X09X60156\].issn:0002838X,contentType:Journals}](https://www.clinicalkey.com#!/BrowserCtrl/doBrowseTo/journalIssue/{facet:[1-s2.0-S0002838X09X60156].issn:0002838X,contentType:Journals})
- 2.* Goldberger JJ, Buxton AE. Personalized medicine vs. guideline-based medicine. *JAMA* 2013;309(24):2559-2560. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=927181&direction=P>
- 3.* Norris SL, Bero L. GRADE Methods for Guideline Development: Time to Evolve? *Ann Intern Med*, published online September 20, 2016. <http://annals.org/aim/article/2552985/grade-methods-guideline-development-time-evolve>
4. Editorial. Improving practice guidelines with patient-specific recommendations. *Ann Intern Med*. 2011;154(9):638-639. <http://annals.org/issue.aspx?journalid=90&issueid=20231&direction=P>
5. Seaman AM. Many medical guidelines don't consider costs. Reuters, May 7, 2013. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2013/05/07/us-medical-guidelines-idUSBRE94610V20130507>
6. Kuehn BM. Guidelines, online training aim to teach physicians to weigh costs of care, become better stewards of medical resources. *JAMA Association* 2014;311(23):2368-2370. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=930366&direction=P>
7. Fiks AG, Zhang P, Localio AR, et al. Adoption of electronic medical record-based decision support for otitis media in children. *Health Serv Res*. 2015;50(2):489-513. <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/hesr.2015.50.issue-2/issuetoc>
8. Reinberg S. Heart groups issue updated blood pressure guidelines. HealthDay, March 31, 2015. <http://consumer.healthday.com/circulatory-system-information-7/blood-pressure-news-70/heart-groups-issue-updated-blood-pressure-guidelines-697952.html>

Examples:

- 1)* Morin M. Back pain: doctors increasingly ignore clinical guidelines. *Los Angeles Times*, July 29, 2013. <http://www.latimes.com/news/science/sciencenow/la-sci-sn-back-pain-doctors-increasingly-ignore-clinical-guidelines-20130729,0,185393.story#axzz2jscgny1T>
- 2) Howard J. Cancer treatment guidelines questioned in new study. CNN, March 8, 2018. <https://www.cnn.com/2018/03/07/health/cancer-treatment-guidelines-study/index.html>
- 3) Ganda OP. Deciphering cholesterol treatment guidelines. A clinician's perspective. *JAMA*. 2015;313(10):1009-1010. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=933474&direction=P>
- 4) Graham J. Mammogram guidelines are sparking a firestorm; Critics hit suggestion that women in 40s may not need routine screening. *Chicago Tribune*, November 17, 2009, p.1. http://articles.chicagotribune.com/2009-11-17/news/0911160603_1_routine-mammograms-annual-mammograms-breast-cancer
- 5) Ando R. IBM and Aetna tie up to offer clinical support service. Reuters, August 5, 2010. <http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE6740EW20100805>
- 6) Gordon S. Diabetes groups issue new guidelines on blood sugar. HealthDay, April 19, 2012. <http://consumer.healthday.com/Article.asp?AID=663893>
- 7) Nussbaum A. Aetna urges moms to avoid cesareans births to reduce risk. Bloomberg.com, July 12, 2012. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2012-07-13/aetna-urges-moms-to-avoid-cesareans-births-to-reduce-risk.html>

Use of Treatment Reminders

1. Derosé SF, Dudl JR, Benson VM, et al. Point-of-service reminders for prescribing cardiovascular medications. *Am J Manag Care*. 2005;11(5):298-304. <http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2005/2005-05-vol11-n5/May05-2027p298-304/>
2. Marcus AD. Big data treasure trove from routine medical checkups. *The Wall Street Journal*, May 12, 2014. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1523785007/fulltext/27BE5B13AE7A4170PQ/2?accountid=14586>
3. Shinal J. If 'clean' big data can improve U.S. health care. *USA Today*, August 28, 2014. <http://www.usatoday.com/story/tech/columnist/shinal/2014/05/14/medical-privacy-health/9087873/>
4. Meeker D, Linder JA, Fox CR, et al. Effect of Behavioral Interventions on Inappropriate Antibiotic Prescribing Among Primary Care Practices. A Randomized Clinical Trial. *JAMA*. 2016;315(6):562-570. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/issue/315/6>

Examples:

- 1) Mathews AW. WellPoint's new hire. What is Watson? *Wall Street Journal* online, September 12, 2011. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424053111903532804576564600781798420.html>

Managing Imaging Use and Costs: Combining Utilization Management Tools

- 1.* Levin DC, Parker L, Palit CD, Rao VM. After nearly a decade of rapid growth, use and complexity of imaging declined, 2008-14. *Health Aff*. 2017;36(4):663-670. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/36/4.toc>

- 2.* Lee DW, Levy F. The sharp slowdown in growth of medical imaging: An early analysis suggests combination of policies was the cause. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(8):1876-1884.
<http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/8/1876.full.pdf+html>
- 3.* Iglehart JK. Health insurers and medical-imaging policy – a work in progress. *N Engl J Med.* 2009;360(10):1030-1037. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMhpr0808703>
- 4.* Rao VM, Levin DC. The overuse of diagnostic imaging and the choosing wisely initiative. *Ann Intern Med.* 2012;157(8):574-576. <http://annals.org/article.aspx?articleid=1355170>
5. Tynan A, Berenson RA, Christianson JB. Health plans target advanced imaging services: cost, quality and safety concerns prompt renewed oversight. Center for Studying Health System Change Issue Brief No. 118, February 2008. <http://www.hschange.com/CONTENT/968/>
6. Seaman AM. Many lower back MRI scans may be unnecessary. Reuters, March 25, 2013. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2013/03/25/us-lower-back-mri-idUSBRE92O0XV20130325>

Examples:

- 1) Mathews AW. Insurers hire radiology police to vet scanning; firms make doctors justify costly CTs, MRIs and PETs; patients 'stuck in the middle'. *Wall Street Journal*, November 6, 2008. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB122591900516802409.html>
- 2) Kaiser Health News. Concerns about unnecessary scans and radiation risk prompt reviews by doctors. March 2, 2010. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/daily-reports/2010/march/02/radiation-and-ct-scans.aspx?referrer=search>
- 3) Galewitz P. Imaging at the doctor's: Good thing or transparent ploy? *USA Today*, August 23, 2010. http://www.usatoday.com/yourlife/health/healthcare/doctorsnurses/2010-08-23-Imaging23_ST_N.htm
- 4) Parashar A. In emergency rooms, it's getting tougher to say 'no' to CT scans. Kaiser Health News, November 29, 2010. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Stories/2010/November/29/CT-scan-study-short-take.aspx>
- 5) Carey MA. Medical imaging advocates fight proposals requiring advance authorization. Kaiser Health News, October 18, 2011. <http://capsules.kaiserhealthnews.org/index.php/2011/10/medical-imaging-advocates-fight-proposals-requiring-advance-authorization/>
- 6) Bardin J. Use of imaging tests soars, raising questions on radiation risk. *Los Angeles Times* online, June 20, 2012. <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/jun/12/science/la-sci-ct-mri-growth-20120613>
- 7) Hancock J. Pressure from insurers, government cuts radiology use and spending. KHN Blog, September 10, 2012. <http://capsules.kaiserhealthnews.org/index.php/2012/09/pressure-from-insurers-government-cuts-radiology-use-and-spending/>

Medicare Utilization Initiatives

- 1.* Pecquet J. Bipartisan duo fights proposals to curb medical imaging. The Hill, March 31, 2011. <http://thehill.com/blogs/healthwatch/medicare/163957-bipartisan-duo-fights-proposals-to-curb-medical-imaging>
2. U.S. Government Accountability Office. Medicare: per capita method can be used to profile physicians and provide feedback on resource use. Summary. September 25, 2009. <http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-09-802>
3. Carey MA, Serafini MW. Doctors balk at proposal to cut Medicare's use of imaging. Kaiser Health News, June 14, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Daily-Reports/2011/June/15/1khnstory.aspx>
4. Shen E, Koyama SY, Huynh DN et al. Association of a dedicated post-hospital discharge follow-up visit and 30-day readmission risk in a Medicare Advantage population. *JAMA Intern Med.* 2017;177(1):132-134. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamainternalmedicine/issue/177/1>

Further Readings on Imaging

1. Verel D. Google to reshape how it provides health information, Mayo Clinic joins as a partner. MedCity News, February 10, 2015. <http://medcitynews.com/2015/02/google-seeks-bring-accuracy-online-health-information/>
2. Bogdanich W, McGinty JC. Medicare claims showing overuse of CT scanning. *New York Times*, June 18, 2011, p. A.1. <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/06/18/health/18radiation.html?pagewanted=all>
3. Bogdanich W, Ruiz RR. F.D.A. to increase oversight of medical radiation. *The New York Times*, February 10, 2010. <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/02/10/health/policy/10radiation.html>
4. Franklin C. Before you get that CT scan... *Chicago Tribune*, March 17, 2011, p.21. http://articles.chicagotribune.com/2011-03-17/opinion/ct-oped-0317-scanner-20110317_1_future-cancers-ct-scans-ct-colonography
5. Holcombe D. Oncology management programs for payers and physicians. *Am J Manag Care* 2011;17:e182-e186. http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2011/2011-5-vol17-n5/AJMC_11JOPmayHolcombe_e182to6
6. Iglehart JK. The new era of medical imaging — progress and pitfalls. *N Engl J Med.* 2006;354(26):2822-2828. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMhpr061219>
7. Kaiser Health News. Federal officials focus on radiation practices at Florida clinic; medical scan makers announce new efforts to prevent mistakes. February 26, 2010. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Daily-Reports/2010/February/26/Radiation.aspx>
8. Kaiser Health News. *Los Angeles Times* examines growing popularity, concerns regarding CT scans. September 8, 2008. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/daily-reports/2008/september/08/dr00054331.aspx?referrer=search>
9. Landro L. The informed patient: better ways to treat back pain; insurers, employers target excessive scans and surgeries to improve patient outcomes. *Wall Street Journal*, May 16, 2007. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB117926943880204067.html>

10. Perrone M. Medical scan makers to install radiation controls. *Seattle Times* online. February 25, 2010. http://seattletimes.nwsources.com/html/business/technology/2011184043_apusradiationscansafety.html
11. Phelps D. Insurers want 2nd opinion before approving scans. MPR News, January 4, 2007. <http://minnesota.publicradio.org/display/web/2007/01/04/scans>
12. PR Newswire. Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Wisconsin expands transparency of diagnostic imaging. October 21, 2007. <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/anthem-blue-cross-and-blue-shield-expands-cost-disclosure-tool-to-northcentral-wisconsin-65185497.html>
13. Salganik MW. Medical scans zapping insurers. *Baltimore Sun*, May 13, 2007. http://articles.baltimoresun.com/2007-05-13/business/0705130014_1_pet-scans-emission-tomography-positron-emission
14. Sataline S. Doctors may risk overuse of CT scans. *Wall Street Journal*, November 29, 2007. <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB119627836509306828.html>
15. Serafini MW, Carey MG. Panel urges crackdown on Medicare's use of imaging. Kaiser Health News, June 14, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Stories/2011/June/15/Medicare-imaging.aspx>
16. Steenhuisen J. Doctors work on radiation problem to ease fears. Reuters, June 7, 2010. <http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE6565Y820100608>
17. Steenhuisen J. Younger Americans overexposed to radiation risk. Reuters, August 27, 2009. <http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE57P59Z20090827>
18. Szabo L. Cancer risks prompt doctors to try to lower imaging scan radiation. *USA Today*. http://www.usatoday.com/news/health/2010-05-05-radiation05_st_N.htm
19. Tanner L. Use of costly scans is climbing in cancer patients. April 27, 2010. <http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/36807258/ns/health-cancer/>
20. Carroll AE. The placebo effect doesn't apply just to pills. *The New York Times*, October 6, 2014. <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/10/07/upshot/the-placebo-effect-doesnt-apply-just-to-pills.html>
21. Greene RA, Beckman H, Chamberlain J, et al. Increasing adherence to a community-based guideline for acute sinusitis through education, physician profiling, and financial incentives. *Am J Manag Care*. 2004;10(10):670-678. <http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2004/2004-10-vol10-n10/Oct04-1901p670-678/>
22. Beck M. Big bets on proton therapy face uncertain future. *The Wall Street Journal*, May 26, 2015. <http://www.wsj.com/articles/big-bets-on-proton-therapy-face-uncertain-future-1432667393>

Further Readings – General

1. O'Connor PJ, Sperl-Hillen J, Johnson PE. Customized feedback to patients and providers failed to improve safety or quality of diabetes care. A randomized trial. *Diabetes Care* 2009;32(7):1158-1163. <http://care.diabetesjournals.org/content/32/7/1158.full.pdf+html>
2. Paltrow SJ. Insurers' black box. Center for American Progress, October 23, 2009. http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/2009/10/black_box.html
3. Bindman A. Can Physician Profiles Be Trusted? *JAMA*. 1999;281(22):2142-2143. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=4646&direction=P>
4. Reddy V. Cost of care should matter to doctors, too. *Detroit Free Press*, April 4, 2015. <https://www.google.com/webhp?sourceid=chrome-instant&ion=1&espv=2&ie=UTF-8#q=Cost+of+care+should+matter+to+doctors%2C+too>
5. PR Newswire. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan launches initiative to compare costs of care at hospitals across Michigan. October 15, 2013. <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/blue-cross-blue-shield-of-michigan-launches-initiative-to-compare-costs-of-care-at-hospitals-across-michigan-227821661.html>
6. Whalen J. Hospitals cut costs by getting doctors to stick to guidelines. *Wall Street Journal*, September 22, 2014. <http://online.wsj.com/articles/hospitals-cut-costs-by-getting-doctors-to-stick-to-guidelines-1411416051>

November 26, 2018

Moving Towards Value-based Payment

During the 1980s through the mid-1990s, most provider payment arrangements employed by health plans were designed to influence providers to reduce unnecessary service utilization. Then, responding to consumer backlash, plans and employers largely reverted to fee-for-service payment. However, over the past decade, health plans and purchasers have initiated a variety of new payment approaches that have broader behavioral change goals, including improving quality of care, implementing evidence-based medical practices effectively, and supporting the restructuring of care delivery. Some of these approaches blend traditional fee-for-service with payments related to provider performance. Recently, Medicare and some Medicaid programs have instituted payment reforms with similar objectives. We will discuss employer and health plan first steps toward value-based payment methodologies. We also describe parallel payment initiatives by Medicare that supplement these private sector efforts. In subsequent sessions, we will discuss payment approaches that shift more financial risk to providers.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Understand what is meant by value-based payment.
2. Describe the different types of pay-for-performance and health care home payment initiatives being undertaken as health plans and purchasers move toward value-based payment.
3. Describe how these approaches differ in their design, as well as the challenges they pose for implementation, in

comparison to previous payment arrangements between health plans and providers.

Suggested Readings

Moving Towards Value-based Payment

- 1.* Painter MW. Improving Incentives. Issue Brief, August 7, 2013. Princeton: NJ: Robert Wood Johnson Foundation. http://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/reports/issue_briefs/2013/rwjf407378
- 2.* Emanuel EJ, Ubel PA, Kessler JB, et al. Using behavioral economics to design physician incentives that deliver high-value care. *Ann Intern Med.* 2016;164(2):114-119. <http://annals.org/issue.aspx?journalid=90&issueid=934867&direction=P>
3. Joynt Maddox KE. Financial incentives and vulnerable populations — Will alternative payment models help or hurt? *N Engl J Med.* 2018;378:977-979. <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp1715455>
4. Zimlich R. Value-based payment update: Where we are and who is most successful. Managed Healthcare Executive, November 6, 2017. <http://www.managedhealthcareexecutive.com/benefit-design-and-pricing/value-based-payment-update-where-we-are-and-who-most-successful>
5. Galvin G. How value-based care is changing population health. U.S. News, November 1, 2017. <https://www.usnews.com/news/healthiest-communities/articles/2017-11-01/improving-population-health-1-patient-at-a-time>
6. Conrad D. Implementing value-based payment reform: learning from the field of practice. *Health Aff. Blog*, April 14, 2015. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2015/04/14/implementing-value-based-payment-reform-learning-from-the-field-of-practice/>
7. Patel K, Presser E, George M, McClellan M. Shifting away from fee-for-service: alternative approaches to payment in gastroenterology. *ClinGastroenterol Hepatol.* 2016;14(4):497-506. <https://www.clinicalkey.com/#!/browse/toc/1-s2.0-S1542356516X00031/null/journalissue>
8. Mason D. Is 'firing' the patient an unintended consequence of value-based payment? *JAMA Forum*, February 10, 2016. <http://newsatjama.jama.com/2016/02/10/jama-forum-is-firing-the-patient-an-unintended-consequence-of-value-based-payment/>
9. Goitein L. The argument against reimbursing physicians for value. *JAMA Intern Med.* 2014;174(6):845-846. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueid=930309&direction=P>
10. Fellows J. Doctors feel pressure to accept risk-based reimbursement. HealthLeaders Media, July 24, 2014. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/content/PHY-306716/Doctors-Feel-Pressure-to-Accept-Riskbased-Reimbursement.html>
11. Thomas S, O'Kane M. Value-based purchasing. *Am J Manag Care.* 2012;18(11):750-752. <http://web.b.ebscohost.com/ehost/results?sid=1da13801-2137-4624-a77e-4215ebf746de%40sessionmgr112&vid=2&hid=128&bquery=JN+%22American+Journal+of+Managed+Care%22+AND+DT+20121101&bdata=JmRiPWFwaCZ0eXBIPTEmc2l0ZT1laG9zdC1saXZl>
12. Center for Healthcare Quality & Payment Reform. The best antidote to provider market power is to change the healthcare payment system. May 27, 2014. <http://chqpr.org/blog/index.php/2014/05/the-best-antidote-to-provider-market-power-is-to-change-the-healthcare-payment-system/>
13. Pross C, Geissler A, Busse R. Measuring, reporting, and rewarding quality of care in 5 nations: 5 policy levers to enhance hospital quality accountability. *Milbank Q.* 2017;95(1):136-183. <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/milq.2017.95.issue-1/issuetoc>

Reference Pricing

- 1.* Robinson JC, MacPherson K. Payers test reference pricing and centers of excellence to steer patients to low-price and high-quality providers. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(9):2028-2036. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/9/2028.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* Robinson JC, Brown TT. Increases in consumer cost sharing redirect patient volumes and reduce hospital prices for orthopedic surgery. *Health Aff.* 2013;32(8):1392-1397. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/32/8/1392.full.pdf+html>
3. Kanavos P, Reinhardt U. Reference pricing for drugs: is it compatible with U.S. Health care? *Health Aff.* 2003;22(3):16-30. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/22/3/16.full.pdf+html>
4. Appleby J. Study finds savings low for employers capping their payments for treatments. Kaiser Health News Blog, October 9, 2014. <http://khn.org/news/study-finds-savings-low-for-employers-capping-their-payments-for-treatments/>
5. Robinson JC, Brown TT, Whaley C, Finlayson E. Association of reference payment for colonoscopy with consumer choices, insurer spending, and procedural complications. *JAMA Intern Med.* 2015;175(11):1783-1789. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueid=934633&direction=P>
6. Doyle K. With reference pricing, patients spend less on diagnostic testing. Fox News, July 26, 2016. <http://www.foxnews.com/health/2016/07/27/with-reference-pricing-patients-spend-less-on-diagnostic-testing.html>
7. Fronstin P, Roebuck MC. Reference pricing for health care services: a new twist on the defined contribution concept in employment-based health benefits. Employee Benefit Research Institute, April 2014. http://www.ebri.org/pdf/briefspdf/EBRI_IB_398_Apr14.RefPrcng.pdf

Examples:

- 1) Terhune C. Hospitals cut some surgery prices after CalPERS caps reimbursements. *Los Angeles Times*, June 23, 2013. <http://www.latimes.com/business/money/la-fi-mo-calpers-hospital-surgery-prices-20130623.0.6571991.story>

Use of Provider Payment to Encourage and Reward Quality Improvement

- 1.* Delbanco S. The payment reform landscape: pay-for-performance. *Health Aff. Blog*, March 4, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/03/04/the-payment-reform-landscape-pay-for-performance/>
- 2.* McKethan A, Jha AK. Designing smarter pay-for-performance programs. *JAMA*. 2014;312(24):2617-1618. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=931868&direction=P>
- 3.* McClellan M, Patel K, Latts L, Dang-Vu C. Implementing value-based insurance products: a collaborative approach to health care transformation. Health Policy Issue Brief. The Brookings Institute, June 2015. <http://www.brookings.edu/~media/research/files/papers/2015/06/16-value-based-insurance-products-mcclellan/final-brief--vbip.pdf>
- 4.* Wilensky GR. Rewarding provider performance: ten years in. *Health Aff. Blog*, December 6, 2016. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2016/12/06/rewarding-provider-performance-ten-years-in/>
- 5.* Jha AK. JAMA Forum: Value-based purchasing: Time for reboot or time to move on? *news@JAMA*, February 1, 2017. <https://newsatjama.jama.com/2017/02/01/jama-forum-value-based-purchasing-time-for-reboot-or-time-to-move-on/>
6. Sullivan K, Soumerai S. Pay for performance: a dangerous health policy fad that won't die. *STAT News*, January 30, 2018. <https://www.statnews.com/2018/01/30/pay-for-performance-doctors-hospitals/>
7. Pittman D. Patient deaths: Unintended consequence of quality measurement? *Politico*, November 27, 2017. [https://www.nbna.org/files/\(01-12-2018\)\(Pittman\)%20Patient%20deaths%20-%20Unintended%20consequence%20of%20quality%20measurement%20\(Politico\).pdf](https://www.nbna.org/files/(01-12-2018)(Pittman)%20Patient%20deaths%20-%20Unintended%20consequence%20of%20quality%20measurement%20(Politico).pdf)
8. Werner RM, Dudley RA. Making the 'pay' matter in pay-for-performance: implications for payment strategies. *Health Aff.* 2009;28(5):1498-1508. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/5/1498.full.pdf+html>
9. Rau J. Effort to pay hospitals based on quality didn't cut death rates, study finds. *Kaiser Health News*, March 28, 2012. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2012/march/28/nejm-study-hospital-quality-and-death-rates.aspx>
10. Reinhardt UE. Making surgical complications pay. *JAMA*. 2013;309(15):1634-1635. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=926822&direction=P>
11. Frieden J. Pay-for-performance gains lack staying power. *MedPage Today*, August 6, 2014. <http://www.medpagetoday.com/PracticeManagement/Reimbursement/47089>
12. Greene J, Hibbard JH, Overton V. Large performance incentives had the greatest impact on providers whose quality metrics were lowest at baseline. *Health Aff.* 2015;34(4):673-680. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/34/4/673.full.pdf+html>
13. Johnson C. A revolution in how doctors are paid isn't really changing how doctors are paid. *The Washington Post*, July 20, 2015. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/wonkblog/wp/2015/07/20/the-health-care-revolution-to-change-how-doctors-are-paid-that-isnt-actually-changing-how-doctors-are-paid/>
14. Fellows J. How cardiology compensation is changing. *HealthLeaders Media*, September 3, 2015. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/physician-leaders/how-cardiology-compensation-changing>
15. Ubel PA. Value promotion in health care: the importance of symmetry. *JAMA*. 2016;315(2):133-134. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=934847&direction=P>
16. Ryan AM, Krinsky S, Adler-Milstein J, Damberg CL, Maurer KA, Hollingsworth JM. Association between hospitals' engagement in value-based reforms and readmission reduction in the hospital readmission reduction program. *JAMA Intern Med*. Published online April 10, 2017. doi: [10.1001/jamainternmed.2017.0518](https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2017.0518)
17. Davidson A. A bipartisan way to improve medical care. *The New Yorker*, May 29, 2017. <http://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2017/05/29/a-bipartisan-way-to-improve-medical-care>

Examples:

- 1) BusinessWire. Humana's provider quality rewards program distributes more than \$35 million to primary care physicians in Florida. November 14, 2012. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20121114005577/en/Humana%E2%80%99s-Provider-Quality-Rewards-Program-Distributes-35>
- 2) Blue Cross Blue Shield Michigan. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan and Trinity Health-Michigan achieve new approach to reimbursement with landmark contract. Trinity Health News Release, April 2013. <http://www.bcbsm.com/blue-cross-blue-shield-of-michigan-news/news-releases/2013/april-2013/bcbsm-trinity-health-reimbursement-arrangement.html>
- 3) Lemak CH, Nahra TA, Cohen GR, et al. Michigan's fee-for-value physician incentive program reduces spending and improves quality in primary care. *Health Aff.* 2015;34(4):645-652. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/34/4/645.full.html>
- 4) Commins J. BCBS links \$71B to value-based care. *HealthLeaders Media*, June 3, 2015. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/content/FIN-317016/BCBS-Links-71B-to-Valuebased-Care>
- 5) UnitedHealthcare. Doctors earn more than \$54 million in bonus payments from UnitedHealthcare for improving health outcomes and closing gaps in care. July 20, 2015. <http://www.unitedhealthgroup.com/Newsroom/Articles/Feed/UnitedHealthcare/2015/0720PATHAwardsMedicareAdvantage.aspx?p=1&r=1>
- 6) WellCare Health Plans, Inc. WellCare signs value-based reimbursement agreement with Choice Health Care Network. Press Release, March 31, 2016. http://www.bizjournals.com/prnewswire/press_releases/2016/03/31/FL59492

- 7) Hennepin County Medical Center. Hennepin County Medical Center partnering with Humana on value-based care initiative. HCMC Press Release, May 5, 2016. <http://press.humana.com/press-release/current-releases/hennepin-county-medical-center-partnering-humana-value-based-care-ini>
- 8) Robinson J. Value-based physician payment in Oncology: Public and private insurer initiatives. *Milbank Q.* 2017;95(1):184-203. <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/milq.2017.95.issue-1/issuetoc>
- 9) Anthem BlueCross BlueShield. Premier Health, Anthem sign value-based care agreement. Business Wire, June 5, 2017. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20170605005672/en/Premier-Health-Anthem-Sign-Value-Based-Care-Agreement>

Use of Provider Payment to Encourage and Reward Health Care Homes

- 1.* Merrell K, Berenson RA. Structuring payment for medical homes. *Health Aff.* 2010;29(5):852-858. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/29/5/852.full.pdf+html>
2. Health Care Payment Learning & Action Network. Accelerating and aligning primary care payment models. The MITRE Corporation, 2017. <https://hcp-lan.org/workproducts/pcpm-whitepaper-draft.pdf>

Examples:

- 1) Feder JL. A health plan spurs transformation of primary care practices into better-paid medical homes. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(3):397-399. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/3/397.full.pdf+html>
- 2) Dentzer S. One payer's attempt to spur primary care doctors to form new medical homes. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(2):341-349. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/2.toc>
- 3) Business Wire. New payment and care coordination agreement in place between Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield and hundreds of primary care physicians in Indiana. April 16, 2014. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20140416006035/en/payment-care-coordination-agreements-place-Anthem-Blue>

Medicare Payment Reform Initiatives

- 1.* VanLare JM, Conway PH. Value-based purchasing – National programs to move from volume to value. *N Engl J Med.* 2012;367(4):292-295. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1204939>
2. Ryan AM, Blustein J, Casalino LP. Medicare's flagship test of pay-for-performance did not spur more rapid quality improvement among low-performing hospitals. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(4):797-805. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/4.toc>
3. Barnett ML, Hsu J, McWilliams JM. Patient characteristics and differences in hospital readmission rates. *JAMA Intern Med.* 2015;175(11):1803-1812. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueID=934633&direction=P>
4. Zuckerman RB, Sheingold SH, Orav EJ, Ruhter J, Epstein AM. Readmissions, observation, and the hospital readmissions reduction program. *N Engl J Med.* 2016;374(16):1543-1551. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/374/16>
5. Jha A. Readmissions, observation, and improving hospital care. February 26, 2016. <http://blogs.sph.harvard.edu/ashish-jha/2016/02/26/readmissions-observation-and-improving-hospital-care/>

Examples:

- 1) Galewitz P. Tulsa hospital gives Medicare patients cash back for surgery. Kaiser Health News, October 26, 2009. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2009/october/26/tulsa-medicare-hospital-bundling.aspx?referrer=search>
- 2) Rau J. Medicare to begin basing hospital payments on patient-satisfaction scores. Kaiser Health News, April 28, 2011. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Stories/2011/April/28/medicare-hospital-patient-satisfaction.aspx>
- 3) Pecquet J, Baker S. Medicare proposal links surgical center payments to quality. The Hill, July 1, 2011. <http://thehill.com/blogs/healthwatch/medicare/169497-medicare-proposes-linking-surgical-center-payments-to-quality>

Further Readings

1. Kurtzman ER, O'Leary D, Sheingold BH, et al. Performance-based payment incentives increase burden and blame for hospital nurses. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(2):211-218. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/2/211.full.pdf+html>
2. Robinson JC. Theory and practice in the design of physician payment incentives. *Milbank Q.* 2001;79(2):149-177. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdfplus/3350546.pdf?acceptTC=true>
3. Christianson JB, Leatherman S, Sutherland K. Lessons from evaluations of purchaser pay-for-performance programs: a review of the evidence. *Med Care Res Rev.* 2008;65(6 suppl):5S-35S. http://mcr.sagepub.com/content/65/6_suppl/5S.full.pdf+html
4. Rosenthal ME, de Brantes FS, Sinaiko AD, et al. Bridges to excellence —recognizing high-quality care: analysis of physician quality and resource use. *Am J Manag Care.* 2008;14(10):670-677. <http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2008/2008-10-vol14-n10/Oct08-3648p670-677/>
5. Werner RM, Kolstad JT, Stuart EA, Polsky D. The effect of pay-for-performance in hospitals: lessons for quality improvement. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(4):690-698. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/4/690.full.pdf+html>
6. Oberlander J, Laugesen M. Leap of faith — Medicare's new physician payment system. *N Engl J Med.* 2015;373(13):1185-1187. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/373/13>
7. Delbanco S. The payment reform landscape: Capitation with quality. *Health Aff. Blog,* June 6, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/06/06/the-payment-reform-landscape-capitation-with-quality/>
8. Asch DA, Pauly MV, Muller RW. Asymmetric thinking about return on investment. *N Engl J Med.* 2016;374(7):606-608. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/374/7>

- Rau J. Medicare announces plans to accelerate linking doctor pay to quality. Kaiser Health News, July 22, 2013. <http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/Stories/2013/July/22/Medicare-value-based-pay-for-doctors.aspx>

December 3, 2018

New Payment Arrangements: Bundled/Episode-Based Payment

Private sector plans and Medicare are experimenting with provider payments that bundle related care activities, sometimes in conjunction with reference pricing. These payments place more financial risk on providers but also offer providers the potential for financial gains. While attractive for some services, bundled payments have proven difficult to implement in practice. Nevertheless, momentum behind bundled payments in the private sector (and in Medicare) seems to be growing.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

- Understand the basic design features relating to bundled payment.
- Discuss the obstacles to implementing bundled payment arrangements.
- Understand the evidence regarding the impacts of bundled payment.
- Discuss Medicare support for bundled payment.

Suggested Readings

Bundled Payment in Concept

- Porter ME, Kaplan RS. How to pay for health care. *Harvard Business Review*, July-August, 2016. <https://hbr.org/2016/07/how-to-pay-for-health-care>
- Painter MW. Bundled payments: this way toward a challenging yet better place. *Health Aff. Blog*, June 1, 2012. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2012/06/01/bundled-payments-toward-a-challenging-yet-better-place/>
- Berenson RA, DeBrantes F, Burton R. Payment reform: bundled episodes vs. global payments. Urban Institute, September 2012. <http://www.urban.org/research/publication/payment-reform-bundled-episodes-vs-global-payments>
- Pronovost PJ, Miller J, Newman-Toker DE, Ishii L, Wu AW. We should measure what matters in bundled payment programs. *Ann Intern Med*. 2018;168(10):735-736. <http://annals.org/aim/article-abstract/2678085/we-should-measure-what-matters-bundled-payment-programs>
- Sturijns J, Hayen A, van der Swaluw K. When designing bundled payments, don't ignore the lessons of behavioral economics. *Health Aff. Blog*, April 25, 2018. <https://www.healthaffairs.org/doi/10.1377/hblog20180420.640240/full/>
- Khullar D, Chandra A, Rajkumar R. Beyond utilization: Reimagining providers as consumers to promote hospital price competition. *Health Aff. Blog*, May 18, 2018. <https://www.healthaffairs.org/doi/10.1377/hblog20180515.520870/full/>
- Cutler DM, Ghosh K. The potential for cost savings through bundled episode payments. *N Engl J Med*. 2012;366(12):1075-1077. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1201853>
- Bach PB. Reforming the payment system for medical oncology. *JAMA*. 2013;310(3):261-262. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueid=927287&direction=P>
- Ahluquist G, Javanmardian M, Saxena SB, Spencer B. Bundled Care. The Opportunities and Challenges for Providers. Strategy& (formerly Booz & Company), 2013. http://www.strategyand.pwc.com/media/file/Strategyand_BundledCare-OppsChallenges-Providers.pdf
- Press MJ, Rajkumar R, Conway PH. Medicare's new bundled payments. Design, strategy, and evolution. *JAMA*. 2016;315(2):131-132. jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/fullarticle/2478320

Bundled Payment Implementation

- Robinson JC. Comparison shopping for knee surgery. *The Wall Street Journal*, October 29, 2013. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1445463790/fulltext/22F8CFEA752541BEPQ/1?accountid=14586>
- Hussey PS, Ridgely MS, Rosenthal MB. The PROMETHEUS bundled payment experiment: slow start shows problems in implementing new payment models. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(11):2116-2124. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/11/2116.full.pdf+html>
- de Brantes F, Delbanco S. Reference pricing and bundled payments. A match to change markets. Health Care Incentives Improvement Institute and Catalyst for Payment Reform, October 2013. <http://www.catalyzepaymentreform.org/images/documents/matchtochangemarkets.pdf>
- Ridgely MS, de Vries D, Bozic KJ, Hussey PS. Bundled payment fails to gain a foothold in California: the experience of the IHA bundled payment demonstration. *Health Aff.* 2014;33(8):1345-1352. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/33/8/toc>
- Butcher L. Bundled payment for bundles of job. *Managed Care*. January 30, 2018. <https://www.managedcaremag.com/archives/2018/2/bundled-payment-bundles-joy>
- Freeman GA. Humana launches maternity care bundle to improve care, lower costs. HealthLeaders Media, April 23, 2018. <https://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/humana-launches-maternity-care-bundle-improve-care-lower-costs>
- Snowbeck C. UnitedHealthcare expands program for hip, knee, and spine procedures. *Star Tribune*, May 9, 2018. <http://www.startribune.com/unitedhealthcare-expands-program-for-hip-knee-and-spine-procedures/482211792/>
- Herman B. 4 steps hospitals can take to pilot bundled payments. *Becker's Hospital Review*, June 12, 2013. <http://www.beckershospitalreview.com/finance/4-steps-hospitals-can-take-to-pilot-bundled-payments.html>
- Cailloutte J, Robinson JC. The 'failure' of bundled payment: the importance of consumer incentives. *Health Aff. Blog*, August 21, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/08/21/the-failure-of-bundled-payment-the-importance-of->

consumer-incentives/

10. Freeman, GA. Bundled payments' disruptive effects detailed. HealthLeaders Media, July 14, 2015. http://healthleadersmedia.com/content.cfm?topic=HEP&content_id=318510
11. Boynton A, Robinson JC. Appropriate use of reference pricing can increase value. *Health Aff. Blog*, July 7, 2015. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2015/07/07/appropriate-use-of-reference-pricing-can-increase-value/>
12. Williams T, Yegian J. Bundled payment: Learning from our failures. *Health Aff. Blog*, August 5, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/08/05/bundled-payment-learning-from-our-failures/>
13. McWilliams JM. Cost containment and the tale of care coordination. *N Engl J Med*. 2016;375(23):2218-2220. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/375/23>
14. Navathe AS, Troxel AB, Liao JM, et al. Cost of joint replacement using bundled payment models. *JAMA Intern Med*. 2017;177(2):214-222. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamainternalmedicine/issue/177/2>
15. Regenbogen SE, Cain-Nielsen AH, Norton EC, et al. Costs and consequences of early hospital discharge after major inpatient surgery in older adults. *JAMA Surg*. 2017;152(5) doi: [10.1001/jamasurg.2017.0123](https://doi.org/10.1001/jamasurg.2017.0123)
16. Thompson J, Golden W, Hill R, et al. The Arkansas payment reform laboratory. *Health Aff. Blog*, March 18, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/03/18/the-arkansas-payment-reform-laboratory/>
17. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Tennessee. BlueCross announces bundled payment agreement with leading orthopedic groups in Tennessee. Press Release, May 22, 2012. <http://www.bcbst.com/about/news/releases/default.asp?release=434>
18. Cheney C. The secret sauce for orthopedics bundled payment success. HealthLeaders Media, September 21, 2015. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/finance/secret-sauce-orthopedics-bundled-payments-success>
19. Freeman GA. Physicians' group launches ortho bundling. HealthLeaders Media, December 14, 2015. http://healthleadersmedia.com/content.cfm?topic=FIN&content_id=323689##
20. Pacific Business Group on Health. Case-study: Maternity payment and care redesign pilot. PBGH, October 2015. http://www.pbgh.org/storage/documents/TMC_Case_Study_Oct_2015.pdf

Medicare Bundled Payment Initiatives

- 1.* Evans M. Reform update: CMS to expand bundled-payment initiative. *Modern Healthcare*, June 30, 2014. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20140630/NEWS/306309964>
- 2.* Mechanic RE. Mandatory Medicare bundled payment — is it ready for prime time? *N Engl J Med*. 2015;373(14):1291-1293. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/373/14>
- 3.* Press MJ, Rajkumar R, Conway PH. Medicare's new bundled payments. Design, strategy and evolution. *JAMA*. 2016;315(2):131-132. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/issue/315/2>
4. Bluth R. Bundled payments work, study finds, but HHS nominee no fan. *Kaiser Health News*, January 3, 2017. <http://khn.org/news/bundled-payments-work-study-finds-but-hhs-nominee-no-fan/>
5. Romley JA, Ginsburg PB. Improving bundled payments in the Medicare program. *Brookings Institute*, May 24, 2018. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/improving-bundled-payments-in-the-medicare-program/>
6. Feder J. Bundled with care — Rethinking Medicare incentives for post-acute care services. *N Engl J Med*. 2013;369(5):400-401. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/369/5>
7. Hancock J. An Obamacare payment reform success story — one health system, two procedures. *Kaiser Health News*, April 30, 2015. http://khn.org/news/an-obamacare-payment-reform-success-story-one-health-system-one-procedure/?utm_campaign=KHN%3A+Daily+Health+Policy+Report&utm_source=hs_email&utm_medium=email&utm_content=17398774&hsenc=p2ANqtz-96MqgFqA4Z3wEEA_uCTV0EWG2gkBC6FFu8FvVi4BS71Z5ziSQj_13J37WAR63nX-Ng-VVuv8DsFr9rDcTt0lmngOYf9A&hsmi=17398774
8. Hancock B. What Medicare's bundled payment mandate means for Nashville market. *The Tennessean*, September 29, 2015. <http://www.tennessean.com/story/money/industries/health-care/2015/09/29/what-medicares-bundled-payment-mandate-means-nashville-market/73049178/>
9. Song A, Blumenthal DM. Expanding payment reform in Medicare. The cardiology episode-based payment model. *JAMA*. 2016;316(19):1973-1974. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/issue/316/19>

Further Readings

1. Abelson R. In bid for better hospital care, heart surgery with a warranty. *New York Times*, May 17, 2007. <http://www.nytimes.com/2007/05/17/business/17quality.html?pagewanted=all&r=0>
2. Hussey PS, Sorbero ME, Mehrotra A, Liu H, Damberg CL. Episode-based performance measurement and payment: making it a reality. *Health Aff.* 2009;28(5):1406-1417. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/5/1406.full.pdf+html>
3. Newcomer LN. Changing physician incentives for cancer care to reward better patient outcomes instead of use of more costly drugs. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(4):780-785. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/5/1406.full.pdf+html>
4. Struijs JN, Baan CA. Integrating care through bundled payments — lessons from the Netherlands. *N Engl J Med*. 2011;364(11):990-991. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1011849>
5. Mechanic RE. Opportunities and challenges for episode-based payment. *N Engl J Med*. 2011;365(9):777-779. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1105963>
6. McLaughlin J. Bundling without fumbling: How transparency fits in value-based payments. *Becker's Hospital Review*, July 11, 2013. <http://www.beckershospitalreview.com/racs/-/icd-9/-/icd-10/bundling-without-fumbling-how-transparency-fits-in-value-based-payments.html>

7. de Brantes F, D'Andrea G, Rosenthal MB. Should health care come with a warranty? *Health Aff.* – *Web Exclusive* 2009;29(4):w678-w687 (published online 16 June 2009).
<http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/4/w678.full.pdf+html>
8. Mechanic RE, Altman SH. Payment reform options: episode payment is a good place to start. *Health Aff.* – *Web Exclusive* 2009;28(2):w262-w271 (published online 27 January 2009).
<http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/28/2/w262.full.pdf+html>
9. Emanuel EJ. The Arkansas innovation. *The New York Times*, September 5, 2012.
<http://opinionator.blogs.nytimes.com/2012/09/05/the-arkansas-innovation/>
10. Betbeze P. Get comfortable with bundles. HealthLeaders Media, March 22, 2016.
<http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/leadership/get-comfortable-bundles>
11. Cherner M, Goldman D. Proposal 1: Transitioning to bundled payments in Medicare. Brookings, The Hamilton Project, 2013.
http://www.brookings.edu/~media/research/files/papers/2013/02/thp%20budget%20papers/thp_15waysfedbudget_pr op1.pdf

December 10, 2018

New Payment Arrangements: Global Contracts and Population Health Management

Total Cost of Care, also called Global, contracts between health plans and providers are growing in popularity. Under these contracts, providers agree to deliver services to a defined group of individuals for one global payment. Typically, providers can agree to assume some degree of risk in return for the chance to share in savings, assuming adequate performance on quality metrics. In Medicare, this approach involves contracts with “accountable care organizations” or ACOs.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Describe the basic features of comprehensive, global contracts between health plans and providers.
2. Discuss the obstacles to implementing global payment arrangements.
3. Discuss Medicare support for global payment.

Suggested Readings

Global Payment Approaches and Accountable Care Organizations

- 1.* Song Z, Safran DG, Landon BE, et al. The ‘alternative quality contract,’ based on a global budget, lowered medical spending and improved quality. *Health Aff.* 2012;31(8):1885-1894.
<http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/31/8/1885.full.pdf+html>
- 2.* McClellan M. Accountable care organizations and evidence-based payment reform. *JAMA.* 2015;313(21):2128-2130.
<http://jama.amanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=67&issueID=934110&direction=P>
- 3.* Christensen C, Flier J, Vijayaraghavan V. Opinion: The coming failure of ‘accountable care’. *The Wall Street Journal*, February 18, 2013.
<http://search.proquest.com/docview/1288605719/fulltext/A9A617B0FB39462FPQ/1?accountid=14586>
- 4.* Gold J. FAQ on ACOs: Accountable care organizations, explained. Kaiser Health News, October 21, 2011.
<http://www.kaiserhealthnews.org/stories/2011/january/13/aco-accountable-care-organization-faq.aspx>
- 5.* Murray R, Delbanco SF. Two ways employers should push ACO arrangements to evolve. *Health Aff. Blog*, April 9, 2018. <https://www.healthaffairs.org/doi/10.1377/hblog20180403.38793/full/>
6. McWilliams JM, Cherner M, Landon BE. Medicare ACO program savings not tied to preventable hospitalizations or concentrated among high-risk patients. *Health Aff.* 2017;36(12):2085-2093.
<https://www.healthaffairs.org/doi/full/10.1377/hlthaff.2017.0814>
7. Health Care Transformation Task Force. Levers of Successful ACOs. Author, November 8, 2017.
<https://hcttf.org/2017-11-8-levers-of-successful-acos/>
8. Lewis D. How health plans can help employers evaluate accountable care organizations. AHIP Blog, September 25, 2017. <https://www.ahip.org/how-health-plans-can-help-employers-evaluate-affordable-care-organizations/>
9. Shields MC, Patel PH, Manning M, Sacks L. A model for integrating independent physicians into accountable care organizations. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(1):161-172. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/1/161.full.pdf+html>
10. Mechanic RE, Santos P, Landon BE, Cherner ME. Medical group responses to global payment: early lessons from the ‘alternative quality contract’ in Massachusetts. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(9):1734-1742.
<http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/9/1734.full.pdf+html>
11. Baicker K, Rosenthal M. Shared savings, shared decisions, and incentives for high-value medical care. *JAMA Intern Med.* 2014;174(12):2014-2015.
<http://archinte.amanetwork.com/Issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueID=931146&direction=P>
12. Colla CH, Lewis VA, Shortell SM, Fisher ES. First national survey of ACOs finds that physicians are playing strong leadership and ownership roles. *Health Aff.* 2014;33(6):964-971. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/33/6.toc>
13. Petersen M, Muhlestein D. ACO results: What we know so far. *Health Aff. Blog*, May 30, 2014.
<http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/05/30/aco-results-what-we-know-so-far/>
14. Herman B. Many private-payer ACOs fail to yield lower costs, better quality. *Modern Healthcare*, October 15, 2015.
<http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20151015/NEWS/151019940>

Examples:

- 1)* Melnick G, Green L. Four years into a commercial ACO for CalPERS: Substantial savings and lessons learned. *Health Aff. Blog*, April 17, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/04/17/four-years-into-a-commercial-aco-for-calpers-substantial-savings-and-lessons-learned/>
- 2) Overland D. Medica launches private exchange to sell ACO products. *FierceHealthPayer*, October 16, 2012. <http://www.fiercehealthpayer.com/story/medica-launches-private-exchange-sell-aco-products/2012-10-16>
- 3) HealthPartners. HealthPartners among first to receive accountable care organization accreditation from NCQA. News Release, Business Wire, February 14, 2013. <http://www.businesswire.com/news/home/20130214006237/en/HealthPartners-receive-Accountable-Care-Organization-accreditation-NCQA>
- 4) Lowrey A. A health provider finds success in keeping hospital beds empty. *The New York Times*, April 23, 2013. http://www.nytimes.com/2013/04/24/business/accountable-care-helping-hospitals-keep-medical-costs-down.html?pagewanted=all&_r=0
- 5) McCann E. Bon Secours, Aetna ink big ACO Deal. *Healthcare IT News*, June 25, 2013. <http://www.healthcareitnews.com/news/bon-secours-aetna-ink-big-aco-deal>
- 6) Cheney C. Highmark execs detail ACO transformation. *HealthLeaders Media*, May 13, 2014. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/HEP-304400/Highmark-Execs-Detail-ACO-Transformation##>
- 7) Commins J. Providence, Swedish Health launch employer-driven ACO. *HealthLeaders Media*, July 7, 2014. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/page-1/HEP-306131/Providence-Swedish-Health-Launch-EmployerDriven-ACO>
- 8) Cheney C. Aetna's accountable care chief on providers assuming risk. *HealthLeaders Media*, June 24, 2015. http://healthleadersmedia.com/content.cfm?topic=HEP&content_id=317845
- 9) Leys T. Wellmark sees \$35 million savings from ACO contracts. *Des Moines Register*, July 26, 2016. <http://www.desmoinesregister.com/story/news/health/2016/07/26/wellmark-sees-35-million-savings-aco-contracts/87537846/>

Medicare Global Contracts with Accountable Care Organizations

- 1.* Mostashari F, White R. The ACO hypothesis: What we're learning from the Medicare shared savings programs. *Brookings*, March 10, 2014. <http://www.brookings.edu/blogs/up-front/posts/2014/03/10-medicare-aco-health-care-savings-hospital-physician-mostashari>
- 2.* Schulman KA, Richman BD. Reassessing ACOs and Health Care Reform. *JAMA*. 2016;316(7):707-708. <http://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/issue/316/7>
3. CareCentrix. Post-acute care. Savings for Medicare Advantage plans. Author, 2018. <https://www.carecentrix.com/resources/whitepapers/post-acute-care-savings-medicare-advantage-plans>
4. Binder J. Doctors should be rewarded for quality care – not for cutting corners. *Health Aff. Blog*, July 19, 2013. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2013/07/19/doctors-should-be-rewarded-for-quality-care-not-for-cutting-corners/>
5. Ginsburg PB. Accountable care organizations 2.0: linking beneficiaries. *JAMA Intern Med*. 2014;174(6):945-946. <http://archinte.jamanetwork.com/issue.aspx?journalid=71&issueid=930309&direction=P>
6. Damore J, Champion W. Key success factors for the Medicare shared savings program. *Health Aff. Blog*, August 21, 2014. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2014/08/21/key-success-factors-for-the-medicare-shared-savings-program/>
7. Rau J. One-quarter of ACOs save enough money to earn bonuses. *Kaiser Health News Blog*, September 16, 2014. <http://kaiserhealthnews.org/news/one-quarter-of-acos-save-enough-money-to-earn-bonuses/>
8. Casalino LP. Pioneer accountable care organizations: traversing rough country. *JAMA*. published online May 4, 2015. <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/onlineFirst.aspx>
9. Rau J, Gold J. Medicare yet to save money through heralded medical payment model. *Kaiser Health News*, September 14, 2015. <http://khn.org/news/medicare-yet-to-save-money-through-heralded-medical-payment-model/>
10. Schur CL, Sutton JP. Physicians in Medicare ACOs offer mixed views of model for health care cost and quality. *Health Aff.* 2017;36(4):649-654. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/36/4.toc>
11. Ryan AM, Krinsky S, Adler-Millstein J, et al. Association between hospitals' engagement in value-based reforms and readmission reduction in the hospital readmission reduction program. *JAMA Intern Med*. 2017;177(6):862-868. DOI: 10.1001/jamainternmed.2017.0518

Further Readings

1. Crosby J. Feds reward Park Nicollet for healthy patients. *StarTribune*, August 8, 2011. <http://www.startribune.com/business/127283643.html>
2. NCQA Press Release. NCQA releases HEDIS for ACOs. September 11, 2012. <http://www.ncqa.org/Newsroom/2012NewsArchive/NewsReleaseSeptember112012.aspx>
3. Rosenthal MB, Cutler DM, Feder J. The ACO rules – striking the balance between participation and transformative potential. *N Engl J Med*. 2011;365:e6. <http://www.nejm.org/doi/pdf/10.1056/NEJMp1106012>
4. Berenson RA. Shared savings program for accountable care organizations: a bridge to nowhere? *Am J Manag Care*. 2010;16(10):721-726. http://www.ajmc.com/publications/issue/2010/2010-10-vol16-n10/AJMC_10oct_Berenson_721to726/
5. Evans M. About 60% of physician practices avoiding ACOs, study finds. *Modern Healthcare*, March 17, 2014. <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20140317/blog/303179999>

6. Higgins A, Stewart K, Dawson K, Bocchino C. Early lessons from accountable care models in the private sector: partnerships between health plans and providers. *Health Aff.* 2011;30(9):1718-1727. <http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/30/9/1718.full.pdf+html>
7. Landon BE. Keeping score under a global payment system. *N Engl J Med.* 2012;366(5):393-395. <http://www.nejm.org/toc/nejm/366/5>
8. Betbeze P. Incentives, motivations clash under ACOs. HealthLeaders Media, April 26, 2013. <http://www.healthleadersmedia.com/content/LED-291569/Incentives-Motivations-Clash-Under-ACOs##>
9. Bailit M, Hughes C, Burns M, Freedman DH. Shared-savings payment arrangement in health care. Six case studies. Commonwealth Fund, August 2012. <http://www.commonwealthfund.org/Publications/Fund-Reports/2012/Aug/Shared-Savings-Payment-Arrangements.aspx>
10. Medica. Medica continues expansion of ACO offerings in Minnesota. November 14, 2013. <http://newscenter.medica.com/press-release/products-services/medica-continues-expansion-aco-offerings-min>
11. Independence Blue Cross. Independence Blue Cross announced results of its accountable care organization (ACO) payment model. July 14, 2014. <http://www.bcbs.com/healthcare-news/plans/lbc-Announces-The-Results-Of-Its-Aco-Payment-Model.html>
12. Klar R. ACO 101: the basics of accountable care. *Health Aff. Blog*, August 29, 2011. <http://healthaffairs.org/blog/2011/08/29/aco-101-the-basics-of-accountable-care/>
13. Centers of Medicare and Medicaid Services. Pioneer accountable care organization model. General Fact Sheet, September 12, 2012. <https://innovation.cms.gov/initiatives/Pioneer-aco-model/>
14. Cigna. Cigna extends collaborative care to 75,000 Floridians through new arrangements with five medical groups. Press release, February 9, 2016. <http://www.cigna.com/newsroom/news-releases/2016/cigna-extends-collaborative-care-to-75000-floridians-through-new-arrangements-with-five-medical-groups>